

**EMPOWERMENT IN DEVELOPMENT:
A CRITICAL REVIEW**

Dissertation submitted to Jawaharlal Nehru University
In partial fulfillment of the requirements for
the award of the Degree of

MASTER OF PHILOSOPHY

SACHITRA CHITRAKAR



CENTRE OF SOCIAL MEDICINE & COMMUNITY HEALTH
SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
JAWAHARLAL NEHRU UNIVERSITY
NEW DELHI- 110067
2006



CENTRE OF SOCIAL MEDICINE & COMMUNITY HEALTH
SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
JAWAHARLAL NEHRU UNIVERSITY
New Delhi - 110 067

CERTIFICATE

This dissertation entitled **EMPOWERMENT IN DEVELOPMENT: A CRITICAL REVIEW** is submitted in partial fulfillment of six credits for the award of the **Degree of Masters of Philosophy (M. Phil.)** of this University. This dissertation has not been submitted for the award of any other degree of this university or any other university and is my original work.

Sachitra Chitrakar

I recommend that this dissertation be placed before the examiners for evaluation.

Prof. K. R. Nayar

(Supervisor)

Prof. K. R. Nayar

(Chairperson)

Chairperson

*Centre of Social Medicine &
Community Health, SSS
Jawaharlal Nehru University
New Delhi-110067*

Acknowledgements

I would like to offer my sincere gratitude to my supervisor Dr. K. R. Nayar for his guidance and patience to make my dissertation come through. He has always been kind enough to give me time and listen to my endless grievances and confusion. I shall forever be grateful for understanding my other commitments and helping me fulfill them.

I would also like to extend my thanks to my other professors at CSMCH. I cannot forget Dinesh and Mrs. Rastogi at the documentation center who we used to surround after every class in the first year and Dinesh continued to smile while all of us fought for the same reading.

It was indeed a pleasure to have such great batch mates and the memories of evenings after journal class presentations at admin block canteen shall remain where we enacted the discussions all over again. I really enjoyed endless chats with Prachin, Kamolini and Dilip. Due to my own time constraints, I feel I didn't get enough time to spend with my batch mates.

Especially Mita and Peden have been more than batch mates. Peden always made me feel that I was achieving something great even if it was just a half written term paper or a bad presentation at the journal club. I would complain to Mita for hundred times in a month about the same thing but she never failed to cheer me up. And she never failed to tell me that I was doing great.

I would also like to thank my supervisor and colleagues Archana, Joyatri, Anuradha at UNIFEM who have been a great support to make my dissertation come through. They have been very kind to understand whenever I would slack at work and blame it on dissertation. And I would like to thank Anuja for listening to me when I would think loudly about getting down to work for several hours before I actually did. And for being my partner in sin when I indulged in food and more food trying to cope with my two full time commitments. Hossein has been a great support and mentor through this journey. Words don't seem enough to thank him. He has brought out the best in me through his endless support and being my home away from home.

And I am also taking this opportunity to thank my previous supervisor at UNIFEM Nandita Baruah whose faith and encouragement was a stepping stone for my own empowerment.

My family has been a great support. Special thanks to my mom, dad, brother, my bhauju and the kids who always my made homecoming special. And especially my mom for letting me go. It wouldn't have been possible without her faith in me.

Table of Content

	Page No.
1. INTRODUCTION	1-4
2. CHAPTER ONE	5-26
Women's position in the world	5-10
Discourses on Power	10-14
Function of Power in women's lives	14-18
Development and the neo liberal economy	19-22
Development and Women	22-25
Empowerment as an approach	25-26
3. CHAPTER TWO	27-43
Gender Gap and the Market	27-29
Gender Gap as the source of disempowerment	29-31
Structural Subordination of Women of the third world	31-35
Changing Gender Relations or Changing Forms of Subordination	35-36
The Mutual Accommodation of Capitalist Mode of	
Production and Patriarchy	37-40
Causes of discrimination	40-43
4. CHAPTER THREE	44-64
Migration and its links to development	44-48
Women and migration	48-50
Women, Migration, Development and Gendered Concerns	50-52
Discourses on migration in the domain of development	52-57
Increasing awareness on gender and migration where	
experience is not the same as for men	57-64
5. CONCLUSION	65-67
6. REFERENCES	68-73

Introduction

In the 60s when the new era ushered new wave in feminist literature and women's movement that lay latent for decades, it devised various theories to understand women specific issues. Problems of women in new states were different from that of women of war torn countries or the women of countries of new economic power. However, the theory of patriarchy seemed to explain the varying degrees and forms of subordination of women. Even the women of leftist organization, disillusioned by men's attitude towards women, banded together to discuss gender discrimination. They felt that women form an oppressed class whose labour is expropriated by men. Women face some form of gender discrimination irrespective of background, intelligence and education. Though the form and degree might be context specific, discrimination was rampant.

However, criticism started flowing from Black feminist literature who were disillusioned by Bourgeoisie feminism. They felt excluded from the feminist discourse that focused around the experiences and problems of white, middle class women. Kathy McAfee and Myrna Wood wrote that certain movements organized by women around the oppression of women were bound to emphasize the bourgeoisie and personal aspects of oppression and obscured the material oppression of working class women and men (McAfee and Wood, 1969). However, another side of the story is what Michelle Wallace writes in "Black Macho and the Myth of Superwoman". She lashed out the male chauvinism of the sixties black power movement. She said that the belief that the black woman was 'superwoman' who had no need for feminism was a myth. She quoted an example when Shirley Chishalm was running for President in 1972. A Black comedian said on Television show that he would prefer Raquel Welch to Shirley any day. She interpreted it as 'We are more interested in going to bed with Raquel than having black President.' That was also the time when increasing number of black men were going out with white women. The Black woman running for President did not get much support from black men because they united along being males than being black. However, they shoved black feminist issues aside saying black women had no time for feminism because being

black comes first. Which actually came down to saying black men comes before black women (Wallace, 1999).

Along similar lines lay paradoxes of South Asian women. Society is divided along class, caste, ethnicity, religion etc and cross cutting all is gender. Gender experiences across these sections are also very specific and different, yet they are similar by the virtue of being women's experience. Communal interest and gender concerns have often than not posed against each other. Women are often silenced to keep multicultural values intact. Are these genuinely the issues of identity or women are just pawns in exploitation? The powerful usually employs various strategies and devices to keep the power intact. Ideologies, education, religious institutions are among the most useful in production of knowledge to perpetuate the power relations. As Michel Foucault puts it, it is impossible to think of time when there is no relation between power and knowledge (Foucault, 1980). Gender as a created reality has been used to make believe women as subordinate beings where men as a group benefited from women's low paid and unpaid labour. The term has been coined as patriarchy to explain women's overall subordination by men. However, patriarchy also being a living social system keeps changing in interaction with other social systems. Economy has been an important factor that played a role in shaping gender relations and the kind of patriarchy that existed. For example, in the mountain region of Nepal among Sherpa community, Khasis in North East and in high up in the mountains in Ladakh, property is often transferred through women's lineage and polygyny is practiced. The rationale proposed is that since in the mountains, arable land is scarce, therefore, to avoid fragmentation of land, matrilineal practices and polygyny are devised. The debate remains, whether the matrilineal society can also be matriarchal or they are just different forms of patriarchy as women still need to consult men for major decisions and polygyny and polygamy cannot be equated as the experiences are not the same. I would like to state that economy, nevertheless, is an important factor in shaping the kind of patriarchy practiced without getting into chicken or egg debate.

Political economy has a profound influence on gender. Economy shapes gender relations and vice versa. The present day capitalism is shaped by gender relations (Mallon, 1987). Gender is also shaped by the course capitalism takes. The dynamicity of relationship

between structures and systems in which gender is an outcome, owes to power relations within and between systems. One who has power usually controls the sources of power, i.e. economic, human and intellectual resources. Intellectual resources further produce knowledge base and its relation with truth usually helps in furthering sources of power and hence power relations. How power relation started is outside the scope of my study. However, patriarchy and capitalism have been identified as two systems of domination which shapes gender relations. Patriarchy flourished with production of knowledge that favored men. Capitalism flourished in hierarchal society based on class, race, caste, ethnicity, gender etc. Accumulation of capital has taken advantage of all kinds of hierarchy in the society depending upon the context divided by time and space and gender is one of them.

The objective of my dissertation is to explore how realistic is to presume non zero sum understanding of power for women's empowerment when women's bodies and minds are the fields where systems of domination and exploitation play out the power relations and benefit from furthering powerlessness of the vulnerable.

The first chapter tries to unravel the power of patriarchy and capitalism and its implication on women. The first chapter also traces this new kind of development studies that came up after the Second World War.

Women and their gender is a complex outcome of their culture, history, political economy, ideologies. Gender relations have also been constantly changing with changes in structures and their relationships. It is hard to come up with common characteristics of genders and relationship between them.

The second chapter focuses on women who face multiple patriarchies and are also a site of exploitation within this new phase of economic development which is globalizing market economy in the Third World and South Asia in particular. Local capitalist mode might have had different outcomes on women, but globalizing market economy has brought out specific impact. The Patriarchal power over women and Neo Liberal power over Third World women creates an exploitative situation that fuels the

existing power relations. One of the obvious manifestations when women's bodies and minds are played by powers of these systems of exploitation is women undergoing tremendous pressure to fulfill their reproductive and productive roles without any empowering experience for themselves.

The third chapter analyzes empowerment within development on the issue of migration that rests on non-zero sum understanding of power. The second chapter describes the backdrop where women are forced to move from their homes in search of livelihood, but the development discourses surrounding gender, assumes empowerment through migration where increased economic participation automatically leads to fulfill both practical and strategic gender needs. However, trafficking in human being is a direct outcome when migration decision is taken in unequal negotiation power.

The inquiry is based on secondary data and the available literature on women's movement and development studies after the Second World War. I have also traced the development of neo liberal market economy since the 70s to see how the discourses in development have also corroborated with the economic system.

Chapter One

Women's position in the world

It is an accepted fact that all over the world women are disempowered due to different forms of gender discrimination. Women face gender discrimination despite improved social conditions, improved economy, better economic and political participation. A quick glance at international data will immediately demonstrate that almost without exception, women everywhere in the world are worse off than men. On the whole, women have less power and money and more work and responsibility (Seager and Olson 1986). When the UN proclaimed International Women's Year, the data it released showed that women were performing two thirds of the world's work and receiving only 10 percent of all income while owning only 1 percent of the means of production. The picture becomes even more distressing when we consider the enormous socio-economic disparities between the first and third world nations. While first world nations constitute only one fourth of the world's population they receive four fifths of the income (Brandt Report 1980). In India, according to NFHS-2 document women's empowerment as a whole and in each of 26 states with 1999 boundaries, in general, it finds that the average woman is disempowered absolutely as well as relative to men, and there has been little change in her empowerment over time. They use the indicators like violence against women and women's response to violence (Kishor and Gupta, 2004). Within first world nations, women relative to the men of their class and racial ethnic group also tend to be disadvantaged. It is also obvious that women's disadvantaged position is not by sheer accident but systematic discrimination. To understand and explain women's subordinate position there are various theories and vast array of feminist writing. However, patriarchy and capitalist mode of production are understood as the main system of domination.

I would also like to maintain a distinction between position and condition of women. Though women's condition influence women's position and vice versa, they are however, two distinct categories in women's lives. Though some advocate that better

condition of women can lead to better position which is supported by the evidences from Europe and America, where better economic condition has lead to better position of women vis a vis men. This is also one of strong argument for the flourishing micro-credits backed by IMF, World Bank, national governments and NGOs. However we also have evidences from Central Asia, Arab nations and South Asia, where better economy can actually lead to increased surveillance of women, restricted mobility and regression. In India, there has been shocked discovery of the prevalence of dowry murders amongst urban lower middle class families from the late 1970s, there has been evidence of greater gender biases in families beyond the pale of dire need. In more recent years considerable anxiety has emerged over the worsening of female-male sex ratios, which are sharpening outside the classes of poor, leading to speculations of the 'paradox' of the 'prosperity effect', the negative effects on women of fertility decline and the mismatch between measures of 'backward' districts according to economic and gender indicators (John, 2002). John suggests that women of the Third World are faced with greater challenges as they face new problems attached with new economic order before the old problems could be tackled. She says that increasing gender biases are isolated patterns but a potential sign of things to come, as men and women make 'choices' under conditions of limited gains and potential loses in a expanding, increasingly competitive economy.

The position of women can be explained by overarching theory of patriarchy and condition of women depends a lot on their relation to mode of production. Men also suffer due to unequal relation to production, however women's condition becomes severe also due to their position vis a vis men. Though by patriarchy it means the rule of father and it is understood mainly to explain men's domination over women, I would like to add that women also benefit by subordination of other women in the system depending upon their relation to men in power and their social status. And again patriarchy is not an unchanging and universalistic concept but a living social system, it has its own distinct social, cultural and historical specificities for each society. It carries with it its own legacy of past traditions and adjustments to them in any given situation. Moreover, as an active social force, the relative strength of patriarchy as well as its role in a given society are liable to alter in the process of social and economic changes through its interaction

with other social systems such as class, caste or religion that co-exist with it (Banerjee, 1999).

There are different schools of thoughts within feminist theory that tries to analyze women's subordination. It also depends on women's own experience with patriarchy and capitalism that is time and space specific. In that sense what would women's empowerment would mean also depend on one's understanding of women's subordination and their relation with patriarchy and the mode of production.

In case of women's issues I have looked at the women's movement since 60s what they call second wave of women's movement to see where women are trying to locate their subordination or what are the ideologies that maintain that power structure. The writers from the 50s and 60s tried to question the very notion of woman itself. As Simone de Beauvoir says one is not born but one becomes woman. The construction of gender and their roles became a point of struggle. The literature of the time is questioning gendered identity of women. Mostly rejecting biological determinism of women, they have questioned the knowledge itself which is very patriarchal. Then there have been disillusionment for the women from socialist movement, where they found that patriarchy replicates itself in any system. The range is varied. However they do fall into four major streams of ideologies; they do have many branches nevertheless.

1. Radical Feminism is distinguished by its analysis of gender inequality in which men as a group dominate women as a group and are the main beneficiaries of the subordination of women. Radicals of the 1960s symbolized most powerfully the anger of women against the shackles of male power, often in reaction to the theories and organizational structures. This system of domination called patriarchy does not derive from any other form of inequality in the society. For example, it is not the by product of capitalism. The relationship of patriarchy to class inequality and racism is addressed in different ways among radical writers. Personal is political. Difference among radicals is the basis of male supremacy,

for instance Authors such as Brownmiller, Firestone and Rich stress on sex and violence.

2. Marxist Feminists- Marxist feminists developed their critiques in relation to the political Left, and were particularly strong in European countries. They derive gender inequality from capitalism and not to be constituted as an independent system of patriarchy. Men's domination over women is a by-product of capital's domination over labour. Class relations and the economic exploitation of one class by another are the central features of social structures, and these determine the nature of gender relations. Women's oppression varies among Marxist. Often it is seen as family being the basis as consequence of the need of capital for women's domestic labour.
3. Liberalism- they differs from both the above in not having an analysis of women's subordination in terms of such overarching social structures but rather conceives this as the summation of numerous small scale deprivations.
4. Dual system theory- It is a synthesis between Marxist and radical feminist theory. Rather than bring an exclusive focus on either capitalism or patriarchy, this perspective argues that both systems are present and important in structuring of contemporary gender relations. Contemporary gender inequality is analysed as a result of structures of a capitalist and patriarchal society. (Walby, 1990)

Dual system theory has been analytically useful to explain women's subordination in a varied cultural and economic context. The dual system theory is again articulated in a range of ways. Zillah R. Eisenstein says patriarchy and capitalism are fused into one making it capitalist patriarchy (Eisenstein, 1979), whereas Heidi Hartmann says they are two analytically distinct but empirically interacting systems. She sees patriarchal relations crucially operating at the level of the expropriation of women's labour by men, and not at the level of ideology and the unconscious. She argues that both housework and wage labour are important sites of women's exploitation by men within the field of paid work. Occupational segregation is used by organize men to keep access to the best paid jobs for themselves at the expense of women. Within the household women do more labour than men, even if they also have paid employment. These two forms of

exploitation also act to reinforce each other, since women's disadvantaged position in the family, disadvantage them in paid work. While capitalism changes the nature of employment to some extent, Hartmann argues that patriarchy predates capitalism and that this expropriation of women's labour is new and distinctive to capitalist societies and hence cannot be reduced to it. Hartmann supports her argument with historical examples of how women have been excluded from the better jobs by organized male workers and in some cases states (Hartmann, 1976).

I depend upon dual system theory to understand women's subordination. These are two systems of exploitation. And it is the interaction between the two that brings women's relation to men, to production, reproduction and state. Which are maintained by popular ideologies, institutions and other structures like violence, and the state itself. However I would like to add here as capitalism has been changing to higher forms, patriarchy too has been changing forms in interaction with capitalism and social context. Though they are separate system they bring in different and interesting reality for people separated by time and space and across gender. The flaw that dual system theory has that it is assumed that they reinforce each other. From the kind of changes we have seen around us, it sometime complement and contradict each other. Violence against women would be one of the manifestations of contradiction. While violence is also means to maintain patriarchy, it is also an outcome of weakening of it, especially in transition. However, it is very time and space specific where sometime the systems might draw from each other producing capitalist patriarchy or it might also weaken the other system to gain dominant position. There is a component of power exercised by the people in dominant position in the systems which can shape a reality and change the relation of systems.

Empowerment can be a very elusive concept as women's forms of subordination itself is very context specific and while fighting one form of subordination it might trap women into another form as there are two parallel systems constantly evolving independently and also dynamically interacting with each other. For example, when the women of Third World put poverty in the agenda, and the lack of development was recognized as the main hindrance to women's empowerment, there has been increasing evidences that

women continued to suffer under developmental agendas due to existing patriarchal situation. Women became overburdened by economic activities added to their existing roles at home, childcare etc. The interaction between the two brings very complex outcome.

As mentioned earlier, patriarchy and capitalism are two independent systems of domination that is constantly changing independently and also in interaction between the two. I would like to add the component of power within the systems exercised by people for their benefit. Power is exercised by a group of people within the system who are in the position of advantage. They exercise the power to further their interest within the system and gain more power. Power brings in the dynamicity to evolve the systems to higher state where the powerful get more and more powerful. However one cannot negate the agency of the suppressed which can also change the power dynamics and affect the structure in the system. Women's agency is also equally important because women also can use one system to defy the other. For example, today liberal market economy, which is more sophisticated form of capitalism has aided women to break patriarchal relations. And sometimes women might take refuge in patriarchal system as the fallouts of liberal market economy can expose them to insecurity, severe competition and stress.

Discourses on Power

This brings us to discourses on power. Sociologists usually define power as the ability to impose one's will on others, even if those others resist in some way. For Max Weber, power is "that opportunity existing within a social relationship which permits one to carry out one's will even against resistance and regardless of the basis on which this opportunity rests' (Weber, 1962).

The imposition need not involve coercion (force or threat of force). Thus 'power' in the sociological sense subsumes both physical power and political power, including many of the types listed as power. In some ways it more closely resembles what everyday English speakers call 'influence'. More generally, one could define 'power' as the more or less

unilateral ability (real or perceived) or potential to bring about significant change, usually in people's lives, through the actions of oneself or of others. The thought of Friedrich Nietzsche underlies much 20th century analysis of power. Nietzsche disseminated ideas on the 'will to power' which he saw as the domination of other humans as much as the exercise of control over one's environment.

This is essentially a zero sum understanding of power, there is always a conflict of interest between two parties. If there is no conflict of interest then there is no need to exercise power. But sometime the power can be latent. There might be no obvious conflict and use of overt power as in the case of marginalized, women, children etc as the unequal power relations is accepted and internalized by the oppressor and the oppressed as to make the use of power look natural and it is hidden most cases. It also creates a vicious cycle of powerlessness as the power is used for the gain of the one with more power at the cost of the oppressed.

Feminist analysis of the patriarchy often concentrates on issues of power that men have over women. Though, as explained earlier, different schools of thought within feminist literature depend upon varying degree of capitalism and patriarchal ideology to explain men's power over women. Without doubt, if we go by rough estimation of control over resources, women's labour, women's reproduction, women are clearly less powerful as compared to men.

One of the broader views of the importance of power in human activity comes from the work of Michel Foucault, who has said, "power is everywhere because it comes from everywhere". Importance of Foucault's works lies in the relation between power, knowledge and truth. He outlines a form of covert power that works through people rather than only on them. Foucault claims belief systems gain momentum and hence power as more people come to accept the particular views associated with that belief system as common knowledge. These ideas, being considered undeniable truths come to define a particular way of seeing the world, and the particular way of life associated with such truths become normalized (Foucault, 1980).

“But in thinking of the mechanism of power, it is rather about the capillary form of existence, the point where power reaches into the very grain of individuals, touches their bodies and inserts itself into their actions and attitude, their discourses, learning processes and everyday lives.” (Foucault, 1980)

This way power functions from within the bodies and not from above. Ingrained within the bodies is also knowledge and truth that is by no means neutral but produced by power and for the perpetuation of power. The docile bodies paradigm has been adopted by feminist to analyze gendered knowledge, behavior and attitude of women where women’s subordination is normalized.

The transition from sovereign or monarchial power to modern regulatory power comprised of disciplinary regimes, systems of surveillance and normalizing tactics provides the backdrop to Foucault’s early ‘docile bodies’ thesis. Modern power requires ‘minimum expenditure for the maximum return’ and its central organizing principle is that of discipline. Aspects of sovereign power are carried over into the modern period but function as ruses, disguising and legitimizing the emerging discourse of disciplinary power. This new regime of control is minimalist in its approach but more far reaching and localized in its effect on bodies. The first wave of Foucauldian feminist literature has used it to describe contemporary practices of femininity. In feminist literature that appropriates the docile bodies paradigm, the transition from sovereign authority to modern, disciplinary forms of power is seen to parallel the shift from more overt manifestations of the oppression of women to more insidious forms of control. This new method is disciplinary in nature and more subtle in exercise. Feminist scholars who take up this conceptualization of power treat the account of self surveillance offered by the model of the Panopticon as a compelling explanatory paradigm for women’s acquiescence to and collusion with patriarchal standards of femininity (Bartky, 1988).

Foucault’s later works give way to more complex understanding of power as a field of relationships between free subjects. The second wave of feminist literature has taken up

Foucault's work on power in a different way, stressing the possibilities of resistance over the fact of domination. Here the focus is on Foucault's later development of an agonistic model of power. It stresses on resistance as well as assertion that individuals contest fixed identities and relations in ongoing and sometime subtle ways. This power paradigm has helped feminist who want to show the diverse sources of women's subordination as well as to demonstrate that we engage in resistance in their everyday lives (Deveaux, 1994).

Foucault's work on the relation between power, knowledge and truth remain the most important piece of work taken up by women to deconstruct gendered identity and knowledge. "There is power on knowledge and of knowledge on power. It is not just the need of power for such and such discovery and such and such forms of knowledge but exercise of power itself creates and causes to emerge new objects of knowledge and accumulates new bodies of information. The exercise of power perpetually induces effects of power." (Foucault, 1980)

Upon reviewing the Foucauldian feminist literature, Monique Deveaux argue that both the paradigms of power and the treatment of the subject which emerge from Foucault's work are inadequate for feminist projects that take the delineation of women's oppression and the concrete transformation of society as central aims. It has two major pitfalls- It erases women's specific experiences with power and the inability of the agonistic model of power to account for much less articulate processes of empowerment and emerging body of literature by feminist writers on the issue of empowerment.

Deveaux stresses that empowerment is much more than a relationship of power. Rather than adopting fatalistic view of power one should concentrate on women's capacities for self determination and freedom, and the conditions in which these flourish.

This is another way of looking at power that is Non Zero Sum. It rests on the notion that power can expand. It assumes that one person's gain is not necessarily another's loss. It capitalizes on *Power within* which is based on self esteem, self worth, self confidence and can be translated into other forms of power after conscientization. It also builds on *Power*

to- generative or productive power which creates new action and new possibilities without domination, for example education, economic literacy etc. The other most important component is *Power with* which recognizes collective power that more can be achieved by a group acting together than by individuals alone. It is obvious that this is the notion of power that is used in development discourse (Rowlands, 1995).

The definition of power in terms of domination and obedience contrasts with one which views it in generative terms: for instance 'the power some people have of stimulating activity in others and raising their morale'. One aspect of this is the kind of leadership that comes from the wish to see a group achieve what it is capable of, where there is no conflict of interests and the groups sets its own collective agenda. This model of power is not a zero-sum: an increase in ones person's power does not necessarily diminish that of another. It is quite obvious that in developmental approaches this is the view most commonly used. The power becomes very non threatening to those who have power and very attractive to those who don't have it.

But is there a win win situation in power relations? In the case of women's subordination, is it possible to only rely on the non zero sum model of power and expect that power relation can change? What is it that has continued to keep women in subordinate position?

Function of Power in women's lives

No doubt it is very hard to delineate the relation between power and knowledge. Bodies of knowledge will have effects of power and define the relations between individuals. Knowledge produced provides base for ideologies that will again perpetuate the power relations by appropriating sources of power. Patriarchy as a system and a dominant ideology is based on the power relation between man and a woman that puts men in the position of advantage. Looking at the world's data, men have immense control over the resources hence creating this imbalance which helps in perpetuating the power relations. Ideologies are maintained by institutions like mainstream education, religion, government

etc. These institutions create multiple levels of patriarchies for women. Therefore, women's subordination in patriarchy goes much beyond their relation with man. It exists in woman's relation with other family members including other women, community, religion etc including state.

Capitalism as another system came into existence which flourishes in hierarchal society. It exploits labour based on class, however, it also benefit from women's unpaid labour and reproductive activities. As Sylvia Walby puts it capitalism largely depends on women's unpaid housework for the maintenance of its huge labour force. However, capitalism as a system does not depend on patriarchy for its existence although it is facilitated by the existing patriarchal relations (Walby, 1997).

System defines the structure of power relations. Systems also have agendas. It explains the agency and also on whom the power is exercised. Over time the power relation might look normal due to the very relation between power, knowledge and truth. As Foucault puts it, the production of knowledge is so intertwined with power that it is almost impossible to think of time when truth has no relation with power. It explains the production of vast array of knowledge in gender relations where women's subordinate position is normalized. Gendered identity and subscribed roles of women is almost like a universal truth where it was hardly questioned.

While power finds expression in myriad of social relations based on gender, class and other context specific categories like caste, ethnicity, nationality etc, however power relation between systems is also equally important to understand the complex outcomes.

I have focused on interaction between patriarchy and capitalism to understand women's subordination. The relation between two systems is also that of power relation. Both the systems have agendas. While one benefit from subordination of women, other benefit from class domination. Those who benefit within the systems will use various means to perpetuate these power relations from production of knowledge to violence. The

complexity of gender relations lies in the fact that sometime there might be furtherance of the same agenda while other times there might be clash between agendas.

In the era when the market force is getting stronger, patriarchal relations have been shaped and readjusted to cater to its needs. The market depends upon both men's labour and women's unpaid labour for profit. The state benefits from both capitalism and patriarchy. The balance is maintained by institutions, ideologies, media, violence etc. With the neo liberal market economy, the relation between the state and market itself is changing. At the same time there is tussle between patriarchy and the new form of capitalism which depend very much on individualistic ideology. Now market is entering homes and psyche of individuals. It has brought changes in gender relations. When women turn consumers in market system, there is increasing sexualization of males too. Males are also being socialized to help in domestic chores and childcare in developed countries and urban centers of developing countries as women workforce is much desired as skilled professionals.

But at the same time, it depends upon how women are able to negotiate according to their condition and position. The power within the system of capitalism affects women differently separated by space. While it might produce discourses to liberate women from the clutches of patriarchy to cater to the demand of skilled workforce by breaking family and values, at the same time it might also capitalize on the patriarchal system by reinforcing it to doubling the burden of labour market and the traditional roles. The outcome depends on as mentioned earlier women's negotiating power and the stage of patriarchy and capitalism and which one might prove to be stronger.

Women may also move from private patriarchy to public patriarchy. While economic empowerment which is being offered frees women to some extent it also traps them in public patriarchy which is manifested by unequal wage, harassment at work etc. because the institutions and mindset are still very prominent. So if the empowerment is not complete, then women move from one form of subordination to another without any liberating experience. Sometime the balance is reached between the two forces if women can balance between work, housework, childcare, care of elderly etc. Patriarchal

negotiation with the capitalism is also met by women clustered into specific type of work, low wage which doesn't empower women to challenge the power relation. At the same time women's work at home and additional burden also keep them in low paid, part time kind of work which works perfectly for the market benefit.

However one cannot negate human agency which also brings different perspective. We cannot ignore opposite discourses that come up along powerful, 'normal' and popular discourses. Looking at powerful women's movements, women are oppressed beings have challenged multiple systems of domination depending upon their ideological stands. I would like to feature Women's Development Programme (WDP) in Rajasthan. The WDP was launched in 1984 (with initial funding provided by UNICEF) as a unique programme of empowerment of rural grassroots women in several districts of Rajasthan in India, a region castigating for its feudal, socio economic and cultural backwardness. WDP was different from other schemes due to its emphasis on communication of information, education and awareness raising based on an interactive network linking government officials and NGO staff. The most important figures within this organizational structure have been the village-level workers or *sathins* who were entrusted with the task of building women's groups within their villages. In few years, there was a marked difference in the villages of *sathins* with women's groups monitoring drought relief works, participating in health education programme, taking up small saving schemes and organizing against mass child marriages to older men (John, 2002). *Sathins* soon started running programmes that affected them the most and also found ways to solve within the context.

The independence and clashes upon the issues soon created strife between the village level panchayat and later with the state government. The government tried to curtail the power of *sathins* by limiting them to ICDS programme and later by trying to close the programme. However it generated a massive mobilization- a broad platform of women's groups was set up in Rajasthan to oppose the government directives, and activists lobbied intensively in the capital of Delhi. The closure was revoked. Defending the earlier decision, the GOR claimed that the dismissal of the *Sathins* would save the Government

the golden sum of Rs 30 lakh annually. These actions must be viewed as part of the agenda of the Government of Rajasthan (GOR) to disband the other components of the WDP and merge them with the Integrated Child Development Services (ICDS) which would mean a major shift in emphasis, reducing women's development to child development.

Sathins resisted government programmes like Integrated Child Development Scheme (ICDS), Self Help Groups (SHG), and Integrated Women's Empowerment Programme as they only concentrated either on micro credit programme or women's role as mothers. *Sathins* stressed on overall development of women so that they are truly empowered to challenge the power relations. However, from 1991 onwards, the *Sathin* component of the programme was curtailed in 2002 the number of *Sathins* in 12 districts is 534 as against an initial target of 1200 and there are only 34 *Prachetas* against 237 sanctioned posts. The figure shows the complexity of gender relations with state, patriarchal force and capitalism. The Census 2001 shows a 20% leap in female literacy figures in Rajasthan. Large numbers of women in Rajasthan entered the public arena. On the flip side, figures showed an increase in crimes against women in Rajasthan from 7.25% of the total in 1999 to 8.1% of the total in 2001. The greater involvement of women in public arena did not lead to visibility nor protection from crime and atrocities. In 1992 Bhanwari Devi, one of *sathins*, was raped by five persons in retaliation to Bhanwari trying to stop child marriage in her village (<http://indiatogether.com/petitions/rajasthan/sathin.htm>). Use of violence and atrocities is common to maintain the stronghold of patriarchy. State government has also acted as a patriarch and a capitalist by trying to curtail women's power and use *sathins'* organizational capacity for micro credits, SHGs etc.

Amidst the complexities, in development discourses women's empowerment has been used quite freely. But is development discourses free from power relations? Can development be taken as neutral or patriarchy and capitalism finds its way through into it leading to gender oppression?

Development and the neo liberal economy

Development as we know today is a recent phenomenon. No doubt it has taken various forms in terms of definition and approaches depending upon ideologies, culture etc., however it has its roots in the post Second World War economic and political restructuring. In the process of economic and political restructuring, the Truman administration had taken a particular interest in the condition of the 'underdeveloped' areas. In his inaugural address as the President of the United States on 20 January 1949 announced his plan for a 'fair deal' for the rest of the world, based on 'greater production as the key to prosperity and key' (Truman, 1949, cited in Escobar 1995). American administration prepared the foundation for a programme of active and sometimes aggressive intervention in these 'underdeveloped regions'. Truman's vision of development rested on a assumption that Western capital, knowledge and technological capability was essential for the transformation of 'underdeveloped areas' and consequently, the less fortunate should then seek to emulate American style democracy and peace. This geopolitical imagination has lot to shape the meaning and context of development for years to come. It is implicit in expressions such as First and Third World, North and South, center and periphery. The social production of space implicit in these terms is bound with the production of differences, subjectiveness and social orders. (Escobar, A. 1995)

The Classical discourse on development produced during 1940s got institutionalized in the 1950s and 1960s. The reconstruction of war torn Europe provided the model for state directed modernization of the new nations. For structuralism which dominated the early phase of development economics still influenced by Keynesianism, a certain amount of intervention was considered necessary, due to institutional conditions which made growth in the poor areas less automatic than in developed countries. And of course the cold war getting intense between the capitalist and socialist blocs fueled interventionist development. The American administration doled out aids in order to keep away rising of the communists in the Third World nations.

However, by the end of the 1960s there was growing disillusionment with the practice of development and with indicators of development that took no account of the distribution of national wealth. It became widely agreed that the economic growth that actually took place in most developing countries seemed to go together with increases in absolute and relative poverty. In response to this dilemma, it was argued that a direct approach was required to the delivery of welfare outcomes. The modernization theory that assumed the natural trickling down of western political, social and economic model did not become a reality in the new nations ridden by corrupt bureaucracy and society divided by class, gender and ethnicity.

Another parallel intellectual development in the new nations from the late 1960s that challenged the modernization theory and structuralism was the Latin American dependency school, which together with the more global world system theory articulated the weak structural position of the Third World countries in the world system. The dependentists asked for radical political transformation within countries as well as delinking of their economies from the world market. (Kay, 1989). With the focus on state driven industrialization, dependency did not differ much from the modernization and structuralist schools with respect to the content of development. In contrast, another development, a counterpoint of this modernist view, was defined as need oriented, endogenous, self reliant, ecologically sound and based on structural transformation.

However by the eighties, IMF and the World Bank led economic restructuring programme paved the way for liberalization and privatization legitimized by the geographical division imagined as 'North' and 'South'. The United Nations sponsored Brandt Commission reported on the state of the world in 1980 and 1983 (Brandt Commission, 1980, 1983). Significantly, the commission depicted a world divided into North and South rather than First, Second and the Third Worlds. It also maintained that it was in the interest of the North to aid the development of the South because increased levels of economic activity and interaction would benefit all states, regardless of their geographical and ideological locations. Moreover, the political message from the Brandt Commission also touched upon the interdependence of the human race and suggested that

mutual dependence was likely to become an inevitable feature of global political life. This was also the time when the neo liberal market was getting strong hold and extending its arms.

As the 1980 unfolded, the distinction between the First and Second Worlds began to fragment further as the state socialisms in the Eastern Europe and elsewhere collapsed. The interventionist approach was challenged by the rise of neo-liberalism in the 1980s. Another problem with the interventionist approach was that in a 'globalized world', the nation state no longer constituted the dominant framework for analysis and action.

Globalization as influenced by neo-liberal economic policies became the new world for mainstream development, Globalism as development ideology implies the growth of a world market, increasingly penetrating and dominating national economies. One can see that late 70s, 80s was the era of neo liberalism and globalization which was backed by weakening of state system. The stream of thought that came up in development was reaching to individuals stressing on lesser role of the state.

Interestingly during 70s and 80s along with the growing disillusionment with modernization theory, weakening of state, entry of the World Bank and the IMF restructuring policies to rescue heavily indebted countries, the other approaches which gained popularity were Participatory Approach. According to the strongest advocates of PD, normal development is characterized by biases- eurocentricism, positivism, and top downism which are disempowering (Chamber, 1997). The tendency is to equate development with the modernity achieved by 'Western' societies and to copy advanced countries through planning by experts. In 1970s, radicals such as Paulo Friere (1970) advocated Participatory Action Research which created new learning environments for people to express their needs and achieve development.

Another approach that also became famous during the 1970s was the Basic Needs Approach among the vast array of programmes focused on households and covering aspects of health, education, farming and reproduction practices designed to create a



TH-13139

minimum level of welfare for the weakest groups in society. (Escobar, 1995). Though BNA did much to put poverty, human needs and rights back on official development agendas in the 1970s, many assert that the decade of the 1980s was one of the development 'reversals' rather than achievements with evidence, particularly in Africa, of falling school enrolments and literacy levels. (Simon, 1999). Similarly development theory was proposed to have reached an 'impasse' (Schuurman 1993) through the predominance and power of neo-liberal development ideas.

What is even more interesting to see was how it fitted into the new liberal approaches in the weakening of state power and market penetrating into the households. For example PD was later used for greater efficiency. For example, Women in Development initiatives of the 1970s aimed at incorporating women into the planning process for the greater cooperation and efficiency in the implementation of pre designed programs. Participatory Development which was initially thought as co-determination and power sharing throughout the programme cycle became a tool and a jargon. Nelson and Wright emphasizes that PD is fundamentally about power (Nelson and Wright, 1995). Participation involves struggle whereby the powerful fight to retain their privileges.

Development and Women

Women's role and position in development has also fitted well in overarching ideologies, popular discourses and women's movement. "Women in development" has come a long way since its exclusion from the developmental processes (Boserup, 1970). The lives of women have been profoundly affected by the changes in macro level economic and social policy approaches to Third World development as well as in state policy towards women. This shift in policy approaches towards women has been categorized by Buvinic as 'Welfare', 'Equity', and 'Anti Poverty' approaches which has been expanded by Caroline Moser with 'Efficiency' and 'Empowerment' approaches (Buvinic, 1983). She says that this has been the general trend in Third World development policies, from modernization policies or accelerated growth, through basic needs strategies associated with

redistribution to the more recent compensatory measures associated with Structural Adjustment Policies.

These approaches have been linear as well overlapping. However, the first approach developed was the welfare approach which was introduced in the 50s that viewed women as the passive recipient of development. This approach fitted well into the agenda of the capitalist mode influenced by Kenneysian model. The reproductive role of mother was recognized and policy seek to meet the practical gender needs through the top down handouts of food aid, measures taken against malnutrition and family planning. The period was also after the Second World War. The women's movement had died down. It was also quite common that post wars women roles as mothers and wives are glorified so that men get their jobs back taken up by women to aid wartime economy.

Equity approach is the original WID approached introduced within the UN women's decade of 1975-1985. There was going growing concern among women about discrimination between men and women and widespread disparity.

The writings of Simone de Beauvoir and others that marked the conscious raising of women and paved way for overarching theory of patriarchy to understand and analyze women's subordination talked about creation of women's gendered identity and structural discrimination against women. In her book she describes the creation of woman which insisted that womanhood as we know it is a social construct, that is, that the subordination of female to male does not represent an immutable state of nature, but is the result of various social forces. "One is not born but rather becomes a woman" she writes. She concluded that civilization- all of it, culture, knowledge, art, values- was of man's making. Men are normative human beings. All that written about women by men should be suspect for the men are at once judge and party to the lawsuit. Being men, those who have made and compiled the law have favoured their own sex, and jurists have elevated these laws into principles.

Equity approach draws much from the women writing from that decade. Equity approach came with the purpose of gaining equity for women in the development processes. In this approach, women are seen as active participants in development. It recognizes women's triple role and seeks to meet strategic needs through direct state intervention, giving political and economic autonomy to women, and reducing inequality with men.

As discussed earlier, 70s and 80s were the also the decade of SAP, increased privatization, liberalization and penetration of market into the households. The Equity approach served women's demand to address the structural disadvantage and also the market's need of women's participation in economic activities.

The anti poverty is the second WID approach which Moser calls a toned down version of equity and was introduced from 1970s onwards. It was also the time when Basic Needs Approach was put on the development agenda. During the World's Conference on Women, the difference between the First World women and the Third World women became visible. The male domination did not quite explain the problems of poor women in the third world. Women's poverty was seen as the problem of underdevelopment not of subordination. Increased productivity of women was necessary to improve their situation as well as position.

The efficiency approach became popular since the debt crisis of 1980s. Its purpose was to ensure that development is more efficient and effective through women's economic contribution. It seeks to meet practical gender needs while relying on all of women's three (reproductive, economic and domestic) and an elastic concept of women's time. Women are seen primarily in terms of their capacity to compensate for declining social services by extending their working day. It is a part and parcel of SAP where disinvestments in human resources, made in the name of greater efficiency in IMF and WB's conditionality policies have resulted in declines in income levels, severe cuts in government expenditure programmes, particularly health and education, and reductions in food subsidies.

And finally the empowerment approach which is the most recent and most popular in the Third World. Its purpose is to empower through greater self reliance. It recognizes women's triple role and seeks to meet strategic gender needs directly through bottom up mobilization around practical gender needs.

One can see that the course of overall development that took place and women's role in particular has been much influenced by the role of the state, market policies. Discourses around development have well fitted the strong role of interventionist approach of North in the early decade of development, weakening of the Third World countries in the late 70s and 80s and the liberalizing market. Empowerment as an approach gained popularity in 90s.

Empowerment as an approach

As an approach empowerment revolves around the economic development which is expected to meet women's strategic needs. One should also keep in mind the full fledged neo liberal market economy and globalism at the backdrop when empowerment approach became popular.

In developmental approaches empowerment has been used as a win win situation whereby empowerment is, "The process by which people, organizations or groups who are powerless"

- a) become aware of the power dynamics at work in their life context
- b) develop the skills and capacity for gaining some reasonable control over their lives
- c) exercise this control without infringing upon the rights of others
- d) support the empowerment of others in the community

This too simplistic understanding of power often leads to disempowerment of women. Women fighting against multiple layers of patriarchy and multiple layers of capitalism

from the position of utter deprivation cannot easily transform into empowerment. The subsequent chapters will elaborate on multiple layers of subordination in the context of third world women, especially in South Asia, role of development agencies and the cycle of disempowerment.

Chapter Two

Gender Gap and the Market

Women all over the world as compared to men are far from equal and they are disempowered in five critical areas- Economic participation, economic opportunity, political empowerment, educational attainment and, health and well being. These indicators have been chalked out by UNIFEM (United Nation's Development Fund for Women) to measure gender equality or gap. These gaps usually become the cause and consequences of exploitation as well not just between men and women but also between the rich and the poor. World Economic Forum, using these indicators has studied gender gap in 58 countries from Americas, Europe, Middle East, Asia and Africa. The study report has shown that none of the country in the world has yet reached the state of gender equality though countries have varying degrees of gender gap depending upon the culture, economy and political institution (World Economic Forum, 2000). These factors interact with each other in a complex way to bring a certain outcome in gender relations.

Gender disparity takes a heavy toll in women's well being and progress. It creates a cycle of disempowerment and gender gap. While gender disparity is an outcome of embedded patriarchal society, it also becomes a cause of economic exploitation of women.

Worldwide, outside the agricultural sector, in both developed and developing countries, women are still averaging slightly less than 78% of the wages given to men for the same work, a gap which refuses to close in most developed countries. (International Labour Organization, 1998). Though there might be increased economic participation of women, by economic opportunity indicator it shows that women's employment is either concentrated in poorly paid or unskilled job characterized by the absence of upward mobility and opportunity. The term feminization of poverty is often used to point at the fact that the majority of the 1.5 billion people living on US \$1 a day or less are women. (Marcoux, 1998)

The Inter-Parliamentary union reports a world average of only 15.6% in combined houses of parliament. The statistics by region shows even wider gap ranging from 6.8% in Arab states to 18.6% in Americas. (Sadler, 2004)

Girls and women are discriminated against in education because of stereotyping of the roles and unfavorable job market. Moreover, the content of the educational curriculum reinforce prevalent stereotyping and injustices.

Health and well being rather illhealth of women is both outcome of gender discrimination and cause of discrimination. The women of the third world are still grappled with pregnancy and childbirth related diseases. Malnutrition and related diseases are more severe for girls. Women and girls get lesser access to health services.

Amartya Sen lists out seven types of inequality faced by women all over the world, viz. 1) Mortality Inequality 2) Natalty Inequality 3) Basic facility inequality 4) Special opportunity inequality 5) Professional inequality 6) Ownership inequality 7) Household inequality. He covers a broad spectrum of inequality faced by women all over the world (Sen 2001). Though the nature and extent of inequality might be different depending upon the socio cultural and economic context, however it is irrefutable fact that women in whole haven't been able to get the similar privilege or opportunities or rather empower themselves vis a vis men. It is also noted that the same country can move from one form of gender inequality to other more complex forms with the changing socio economic scenario. In South Asia the girls and women are still faced with life and death situation due to gender discrimination in the forms of mortality inequality and natalty inequality. Without doubt, it is linked with others forms of inequalities. Different forms of gender inequality often feeds into eachother. It is true that in a particular cultural context, one form of gender inequality may be more pronounced than the other; however different forms of gender inequality are often interlinked. It is also been observed that with the changing socio economic conditions gender inequality change forms or become invisible, for example, in the Indian states of Pubjab, Haryana and Delhi mortality inequality is

transforming itself into natality inequality with the prospering economic conditions. It might seem that gender disparity does not exist in the Northern America or Western Europe as the women do not face blatant inequalities like mortality, natality, basic facilities or opportunity inequality but women obviously face ownership, professional and household inequality. Iglitzin suggests that around the world patriarchy prevails, but in diverse and complex conditions “..we must stress that the categories of patriarchy, emancipation and liberation are not mutually exclusive, but often exist side by side within a single country.”

Gender Gap as the source of disempowerment

Marx has seen the source of power as the ownership to means of production. For Max Weber, domination is not the result of property relations, rather, domination results from relations of power (of which property is just one manifestation). Weber posits three possible sources of domination and they are related to: a) economic power (class) b) social power - such as prestige (status) c) political power - organization (party)

Batliwala has defined power as the degree of control over material, human and intellectual resources exercised by different sections of society. These resources fall into four broad categories; Physical resources (like land, water, forests); human resources (people, their bodies, their labour and skills); Intellectual resources (knowledge, information, ideas) and financial resources (money, access to money). The control of one or more of these resources becomes a source of individual and social power. Batliwala's definition of power brings in knowledge, information, ideologies as one of sources of power (Batliwala, 1983). It is obvious that knowledge and information is often influenced by ideologies and vice versa. Ideologies can shape consciousness to accept unequal power relations and perpetuate it. This unequal power relation is often legitimized by ideologies. Ideology is a complex structure of belief, attitudes, and ways of perceiving and analyzing social reality. Ideologies are widely disseminated and enforced through social, economic, political and religious institutions and structures such as the family, education system, religion, the media, the economy, and the state, with its administrative,

legislative and administrative wings. Batliwala's definition provides scope to analyze women's subordination which has been perpetuated and made more severe by dominating ideologies like capitalism and patriarchy. Moreover, it also gives a framework to understand hierarchies within families. A family might be totally landless without any access to other forms of means of production, however within that limited means men command more power than women. Sometime, if nothing men have ideologies as a source of power.

I have looked as power as a control over sources of power and the capacity to control or influence decisions for one's benefit. As been illustrated above, globally men have a greater share over the sources of power than women which has been legitimized and perpetuated by the dominating ideology. The result is a perpetual cycle of powerlessness and gender disparity. As the power is relational, if A controls more sources of power in comparison to B, then B is disempowered vis a vis A. A can influence decision of B or impose decisions on B in favor of A. There are two important factors in the relation of A with B. 1) There is already existing power differentials between A and B 2) The decisions and actions taken by A or B or jointly works in favor of A to increase A's power against B, therefore creating upward spiral of power relations.

Similarly capitalism also works on similar line where the one who controls means of production can create upward spiral of power relations. All over the world the one who controls the means of production also happens to be men but this is not static. Women who are in the position of advantage also create similar power relations with men and other women. It is natural that men who have control over both women and means of production would want to maintain the status quo by maintaining gender relations through production of knowledge in mainstream institutions like education, religion, politics etc, however men are also losing power over women when market forces threatens to liberate women who were already in the position of advantage. Market economy as a higher form of capitalism is much nuanced in its approach. Though it might draw from existing patriarchal relations but it doesn't depend on it. The gender relations of skilled and professional women are already changing with their counterpart

when the market tries to draw them in the skilled labour force. Not so surprisingly, the urban middle class targeted media are depicting males who help out in domestic chores and childcare. The sharp divide of masculinity and femininity is blending as women also turn consumers beyond household appliances. Along with that the patriarchal gender relations is also changing. However, for the marginalized, the story is different. Market economy benefit from the existing vulnerability in women which is perpetuated by unequal gender relations.

Structural Subordination of Women of the third world

While one set of reality exist that women all over the world face gender discrimination, another reality says that the third world in general face disempowerment against the first world. After decolonization, there has been new ways of subordination by the first world. Andre Gunder Frank's Dependency theory developed in the context of Latin American underdevelopment also explain the kind of relations the other third world countries share with the first world. Dependency theory posits that the cause of the low levels of development in less economically developed countries (LEDC's) is caused by their reliance and dependence on more economically developed countries (MEDC's) - i.e. the LEDC's are undeveloped because they rely on the MEDC's. Some proponents of dependency theory assert that LEDC's will remain less developed because the surplus that they produce will be siphoned off by MEDC's - under the guise of multinational corporations. There is, as such, no profit left for reinvestment and development (Frank, 1996).

Wallerstein elaborating on World System Theory argues that Europe moved towards the establishment of a capitalist world economy in order to ensure continued economic growth. However, this entailed the expansion of the geographical size of the world in question, the development of different modes of labor control and the creation of relatively strong state machineries in the states of Western Europe. In response to the feudal crisis, by the late fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries, the world economic system emerged (Wallerstein, 1974). This was the first time that an economic system

encompassed much of the world with links that superseded national or other political boundaries. The new world economy differed from earlier empire systems because it was not a single political unit. Empires depended upon a system of government which, through commercial monopolies combined with the use of force, directed the flow of economic goods from the periphery to the center. Empires maintained specific political boundaries, within which they maintained control through an extensive bureaucracy and a standing army. Only the techniques of modern capitalism enabled the modern world economy, unlike earlier attempts, to extend beyond the political boundaries of any one empire.

The new capitalist world system was based on an international division of labor that determined relationships between different regions as well as the types of labor conditions within each region. In this model, the type of political system was also directly related to each region's placement within the world economy. As a basis for comparison, Wallerstein proposes four different categories, core, semi-periphery, periphery, and external, into which all regions of the world can be placed. The categories describe each region's relative position within the world economy as well as certain internal political and economic characteristics.

While the third world in general suffers from these unequal relations, the suffering of women of the third world in particular becomes more severe because of already existing disempowered situation. The exploitation of these women for the accumulation becomes relatively easy due to lack of choice and opportunity. Historically, the exploitation of both women and colonies has been fundamental to the global system of capital accumulation and sexism and patriarchy are part of embedded ideology. In the present day the current international crisis, women's unpaid or underpaid labour has become the basis of new development programs and policies and is crucial to the recent phase of capitalist development. Women have been depicted as the last of the colony where women's unpaid/underpaid labour has been crucial for the accumulation of wealth (Belen and Bose, 1990). It is more so the women of the third world countries where they suffer

from both kinds of subordination- structural subordination vis a vis developed countries and from patriarchal subordination.

There is a binding pattern among third world countries, they share an unfavourable structural position in the world economy. They are vulnerable to the changes in the world market and flows of capital; their internal inequalities in income, employment, and their populations' destitution and lack of basic necessities such as food, housing, health and other essential services (Sen and Grown, 1987).

Historically, most development programs and policies have assumed that rapid industrialization and modernization would promote economic growth and reduce poverty in the third world. A second assumption was that modernization and economic development would also result in political democracy, industrialization and modernization projects have tended to rely on foreign investment, commercialization and manufacturing for export rather than local consumption.

The international call for integrating women into development made in 1975 was more a denunciation of the male oriented biases in development policies and the invisibility to which official agencies had relegated women's participation than an acknowledgement that women had not been a part of the development process, as indeed, they had been.

It is impossible to address the woman question in developing countries without recognizing that it is inextricably linked to the global capitalist patriarchal model of accumulation. Mallen says this is a colonial question- both women and colonies have served as the foundations of industrial development of the economically dominant western countries.

In the twentieth century, as capitalism entered its monopolist stage of development, colonialism has served to link the colonizing and colonized countries into a global economic network. The unequal relationship, established in many cases, centuries ago,

that has kept third world nations subordinate and dependent, helps explain the continuing internal turmoil and clamor for change coming out of most of these regions today.

The current international crisis, compared by some to the Great Depression, reflects a new relationship between less developed and highly industrialized countries based on the geographic dispersion of the various stages of manufacturing production by large corporations. Attracted by low cost labour, tax exemptions, and lax production restrictions, transnational corporate capital is radically altering the worldwide workforce. These changes are also causing substantial transformations of families and community structure (Nash and Kelly, 1983). The growing integration of the world system of production is no longer based on the exploitation of primary sources but on offshore production on the transfer of assembly plants, primarily in electronics, apparel and textiles, from core to peripheral countries (Nash, 1983).

The hidden aspects of offshore productions occur in 'Export processing zones' (EPZ). Using the presence of subsidiaries of multinational corporations on the US, Mexico border, Fernandez-Kelly confirms that these industries are encouraging the use of young woman's labour. As a development strategy, the subsidiaries of multinational corporations exacerbate unemployment and increase gender segregation in the labour force. Women's alternatives are not substantially improved because these companies offer no job security, minimal possibilities for advancement and frequently expose workers to hazardous working conditions. Instead they contribute to the growing proletarianization of third world women.

The contention that the present day world economic crisis is not just another cyclical crisis, but rather a new phase of capitalist development relying on feminized forms of labour (i.e. doing any kind of work at any time, unpaid or poorly paid) is supported by the efforts of the industrialized powers of force third world nations to restructure or adopt their national economies to the needs of the world system for such labour.

The practical outcomes now occurring as capitalists come to view non-wage labour as a means of extracting surplus value (Bennholdt-Thomsen, 1988). In a detailed analysis of current World Bank policy, she has found that powerful development agencies have made use of the preferability of non waged peasantry in the third world countries by granting their credits for small scale production, drawing peasants increasingly from sustenance to commercial production. This development policy promoted by the World Bank since the early 1970s, claims to attack absolute poverty through 'investment in the poor'. The real yield, however, has been increased profits for the agency from loans to the poor and increased external control over peasants subsistence work and resources.

Increased women participation in poorly paid labour- sweatshop kind of work brings forth another reality which has not only to do with capitalist and off shore production into the third world countries, but also points at the inequality within the country where women and girls face severe disparity discussed above.

Changing Gender Relations or Changing Forms of Subordination

The patterns of inequality between women and men have changed as a result but in complex ways (Walby, 1997). Walby argues that new Development in gender relations- women are more independent but poorer. Political pressure during the last two decades has led to significantly more interventionist forms of policing of male violence against women and children including rape, violence against and child sexual abuse. There are many areas where many women have gained increased access to the public domain leading to significantly increased opportunities, but the picture is complicated by the development of new forms of inequality and by the diversity between women. While younger generations are taking advantage in the new economic model due to increased opportunities in education and technical skills but older women are forced to continue in underpaid, low skill or unpaid housework category.

The preexisting forms of subordination in the South Asia has given space and benefits for the market to seep in. It has brought in a new kind of gender relations. It has provided a new space for women who are already in position of advantage, though it can be argued how much of a space as the opportunity and ownership inequality has made it difficult for women to actually challenge the gender relations. Sylvia Walby has pointed out, women move from private patriarchy to public patriarchy where women are discriminated against in the position ladder. But it is also true that women with educational opportunities and social mobility, have been able to position themselves in high paying, competitive jobs bringing economic independence and other independence attached to economic independence. Though we cannot refute the fact that household inequalities might persist and women may face other forms of patriarchal subordination like sexual harassment in workplace or increased domestic violence. Among the certain bracket of people the patriarchal subordination has transformed from more loud and visible kind to the silent and invisible ones, persistent nevertheless.

In the South Asian context I would like to point out that patriarchy is much more structural. It cannot be adequately explained by radical or liberal or Marxist feminist. Socialist feminist have tried to give more composite picture by factoring in cultural context. In South Asia women have to cope with multiple layers of patriarchy at home, their communities and state. Women are not only subordinated by men, patriarchal economic development, patriarchal state, religion and social institutions but also against other women in the family and communities. Patriarchy in that sense is much more complex and structural. The chances to liberate themselves from structure can be high as there is a lack of support system and acceptance outside their homes. Continued acceptance of subordination is also been coined as patriarchal bargain where women suffer some forms of discrimination and also socialize younger generations in the same line not due to their false consciousness but due to lack of economic, physical and social security outside homes creating a vicious cycle of patriarchal domination.

The Mutual Accommodation of Capitalist Mode of Production and Patriarchy

The preexisting form of patriarchy may have as great an effect on the process of capitalist class formation as class formation has on the forms taken by patriarchy. It is undoubtable that patriarchy and class oppression have interacted historically in a variety of ways (Mallon, 1987).

As been discussed earlier with the off shore, gendered economic development in the third world countries on the one hand and progressive cutdown on welfare system has forced poor women to step outside of homes and increase economic participation to support their families. Walby stresses that different patterns of gender relations are found in different spatial locations. These variations are due to the balance of gender and class forces sedimented over time in local gendered institutions including the local industrial structures and the local political institutions. Changes in the economy and the sexual division of labour occur unevenly through time and space. Globalisation is one of the more significant processes affecting the restructuring of local labour markets, with its increased pressures on economic competitiveness, at least partly due to the increased mobility of capital and the speed of international communications. Needless to say underpaid, labour intensive market has concentrated in the third world countries. The existing gender discrimination, gendered labour market and lax government in terms of labour rights, minimum pay has provided space for exploitation at the national and international level.

It would be interesting to note that during economic depression and market slash more men than women lost their jobs. Women are ever ready to take up whatever is available and work for lower pay than men. (Jacobsen, 1994)

An ILO governing body symposium held in March 1999 concluded that among the victims of the crisis, vulnerable groups such as women, children and migrant workers have suffered most. Also women, when unemployed, are more willing than men to accept work on very disadvantaged terms. It appears that such discrimination is a complex, multi

stage process involving many factors. These factors affect and operate on both the supply and the demand side of the labour market and at micro, meso and macro levels. (Banerjee, 2002)

During economic crisis women who lose jobs in registered factories, soon take up similar works to be done from home and informal sweatshops. Another characteristics of globalizing market is that it has brought in more informal, part time kind of work. It has increasingly taken in more contract labourers sidelining the full time male workers who had a history strong unionization. It fits in perfectly for women with multiple burden like child care, domestic work to settle for part time works though it is highly exploitative and underpaid. It serves both the purpose of capitalist development and patriarchal setting feeding into eachother where women balance their multiple roles but at the same time do not earn enough to challenge either patriarchal domination or the web of burden do not let them challenge structural domination.

Nirmala Banerjee points out that characteristics of women employment is high levels of under employment in terms of the hours worked. In some countries, underdevelopment was a more serious problem for women than for men and underemployment of women seems to have increased for a number of countries during 1990s. In Bangladesh while there was a little difference in male and female unemployment rates, the underemployment situation was quite different. Male underemployment when converted into unemployment equivalence, were still less than 10%. But for women the corresponding figure raised to over 40%. This was particularly in rural areas.

However, underemployment of women does not necessarily mean that women's workload is smaller than that of men. For example in Nepal it appeared that when daily hours of work on economic and other household activities were taken together, both rural and urban women on an average worked for two more hours per day than men. An issue related to underemployment is the over representation of women in part time work, defined as working less than 30 hours per week.

The wage gap between men and women is the result of number of factors related to trends in female labour force participation less investment in developing women's education and skill levels, the structure of the labour market and the changing gender relations. Factors determining the wage gap include discrimination in pay systems, the undervaluing of women's skills and talents, occupational segregation and the unequal sharing of family responsibilities. It has also to be borne in mind that there is a link between wage inequalities in general and gender inequality in general.

The above mentioned example show the wage differentials between men and women in the region are often due to occupational segregation of men and women with women concentrated in low paid and low skilled jobs with fewer career opportunities. In the region, male and female workers are usually segregated into different industries as well as in different occupations.

For example, in Bangladesh, women in agriculture were not supposed to hold the plough, they did some of the work of weeding and harvesting but were mainly engaged for crop processing. In the public sector, women accounted for only 8.6% Class I officers in 96-7 and formed a somewhat larger section -12.5% of the clerical workers. In the industrial enterprises of the unskilled workers but only 13% of the semi-skilled of 22% of the skilled workers.

Secondly, the occupations and tasks performed by women have been undervalued probably due to stereotype perceptions in the roles of men and women in the labour market and society.

Thirdly, a glass ceiling in most industrial/occupations has prevented women from getting promotions on par with male colleagues even when they have necessary qualifications and experiences.

In Asia, the share of the informal workers ranges from 45 to 85% of non-agricultural employment and in the region, the informal economy is largely an urban phenomenon, especially in economies with large agricultural sector dominating the rural areas. 'What is important is that the link between working in informal sector and being poor is stronger

for women than men. Women are concentrated in lower wage segments, working in survival activities such as casual wage workers or home based worker. For e.g. in both Nepal and Bangladesh 90% of women were involved in informal and home based economy. Workers in the informal economy are not covered by the labour and social security legislation of the country concerned.

Causes of discrimination

Gender roles and relations often determine a number of cultural, social, economic and political constraints, many of which are rooted in systematic biases and discrimination. Many difficulties encountered in achieving gender equality in the world of work are closely linked to the general status of women and men in employment and society. Stereotyping of gender roles is often reflected in rules and regulations concerning women's rights such as access to education, the right to individual ownership or land, producer assets and housing laws and practices determining women's access to credit, inheritance practices may influence a women's motivation and ability to work.

The sexual division of labour- On the supply side, they presumably operate through the ready acceptance of the appropriateness of gender based segregation of work by the women herself and also by her family. Moreover, because their beliefs are a part of long standing traditions, families inculcate them in their decision regarding the kind and level of education, skill training and choices of jobs and work that they would give to their daughters and sons. Simultaneously, on the demand side of labour, the same beliefs prevail. Another aspect related to the sexual division of labour that influences women's situation in the labour market lies in the primary and often the total responsibility for housework, childcare, as well as care of the sick and the old.

Hartmann uses anthropological method to explore the division of labour by sex which appears to be more or less universal throughout human history. In the societies in general sexual division of labour is hierarchical, with men on top and women on the bottom.

Hartmann argues that this segregation was not always a hierarchical one. She says that roots of women's present social status lie in this sex-ordered division of labour (Hartmann, 1976).

Many anthropological studies suggest that the first process, sexual stratification occurred together with the increasing productiveness, specialization and complexity of society, for example, through the establishment of settled agriculture, private property on the state-transition from primitive to civilized. Patriarchy as a basis of women's subordination had always existed. Control over women and children by men with the advent of private property, private/public divide, emergence of state, wider exchange and larger production unit has resulted in direct personal system of control translated into an indirect impersonal system of control mediated by society wide institutions.

So existing at the backdrop, a) Traditional division of labour between sexes b) techniques of hierarchical organization and control has facilitated the second process which is the extension of a sex-ordered division of labour to the wage labour system. During the period of the emergence of capitalism in Western Europe and the United States.

The emergence of capitalism in the fifteenth to eighteenth century threatened patriarchal control based on institutional authority as it destroyed many old institutions and created new ones, such as a free market in labour. It threatened to bring all women and children into the labour force and hence to destroy the family and the basis of the power of men over women (i.e. the control over their labour power in the family)

On the hierarchical nature of division of labour between sexes, theoretically, pure capitalism would have been to eradicate all arbitrary differences of status among all labourers to make all labourers equal in the marketplace, why are still in an inferior position?

There are various views. Neoclassical views that the process is not complete or is hampered by market imperfections. Radical view that production requires hierarchy even

if the market nominally requires 'equality'. They emphasize the role of men as capitalists in creating hierarchies in the production process in order to maintain their power.

Hartmann stresses on the patriarchal role played by male workers and continue to play a crucial role in maintaining sexual divisions in the labour process. Job segregation by sex is the primary mechanism the superiority of men over women, because it enforces lower wages for women in the labour market. Lower wage for women forces women to marry. Men benefit from both domestic services of women and higher wage. The domestic division in turn acts to weaken women's position in the labour market. Therefore, the hierarchical domestic division of labour is perpetuated by the labour market, and vice versa. This process is the present outcome of the continuing interaction of two interlocking systems, capitalism and patriarchy.

Patriarchy far from being vanquished by capitalism is still very virile. It shapes the form modern capitalism takes, just as the development of capitalism has transformed patriarchal institutions. The resulting mutual accommodation between patriarchy and capitalism has created a vicious circle for women.

Moreover, compared to these responsibilities, women's other tasks and activities are considered of secondary importance. Consequently women often have to make adjustments for accommodating such family responsibilities and housework which limit the time available to them for economic activities. It often puts limit to their mobility on the demand side also, employers presume implicitly that women would give priority to their family responsibilities.

Lack of access to education and vocational training and productive resources- Mainly due to traditions of pre-determined gender roles, there has been a marked shortfall in women's qualifications as workers in comparison with men.

90% of jobs in export processing zones and a majority of the other jobs created by globalisation are taken by women (<http://www.ukglobalhealth.org>)

However, the paradox remains in the present situation, where the popular ideologies reinforce each other to worsen women's situation. The 90% of the workforce in EPZ are taken by the women on the one hand points at the existing outcome of gender discrimination in the third world countries and on the other hand it is also the changing patriarchal economic structure that depends on the low paid women's labour to accumulate wealth. In such a scenario concentrating on women's workforce participation as a marker of women's empowerment points at serious inadequacy. The next chapter will focus on the role of development agencies that have taken up movement of semi skilled and unskilled as empowerment of those women when they move out to be a part of local EPZ within their countries or across borders, commercial sexual exploitation in urban areas, or fill up domestic work and childcare- a vacancy created when a section of women join professional and skilled labour force.

Chapter Three

Migration and its links to development

The first chapter discussed how women's subordination changes forms to cater to the needs of dominant system/s. Similarly, discourses on development have also responded to the powerful of the systems. The second chapter was concerned with how the new economic system capitalizes on both poverty and gender in the Third World. The labour intensive manufacturing units have shifted to the Third World depending upon the feminization of the workforce based on perceived women's work and cheap labour. The patriarchal situations at home make them vulnerable in terms of economic, human and social capital. Their vulnerable situation is best capitalized by market forces to put them in most exploitative and cheap labour. For the most marginalized women of the third world, it seems patriarchy and capitalism reinforce each other. While on the one hand existing patriarchy deters them from gaining capital, skill, education etc which leaves them with no power to negotiate in the market and on the other hand, exploitative labor, low wage does not empower them enough to break or challenge subordinate position at home. Moreover, women migrating for perceived women's work further support the gendered identity and role.

The process of globalisation has created industrial zones and huge business subdivisions that threaten local small scale livelihood options and food because only limited number of people benefit from this process. The pursuit of neo-liberal policies has resulted in the loss of jobs, 'casualisation' and 'contractualisation', and an inordinate and precipitate decline in the conditions and remuneration of waged workers. Simultaneously, the insecure conditions of the workforce are a strong incentive for the creation of localised zones of production in favoured parts of the developing world to which labour seeks to migrate, as an escape from their own degraded conditions of living. For women, the pressure to find jobs outside one's community and country is especially strong since the earlier means of

sustenance are shrinking. And this pressure to migrate has been building up at a time when gender bias and discrimination in opportunities in the global labour market has become rather more pronounced. Under such circumstances, when the male workforce has lost its few privileges, it is unlikely that migrant women workers will find emancipation at the workplace. (Shafqat, 2003)

Obvious need is the movement of women from rural to urban and across borders to fill in the jobs created in EPZ and also to fulfill the domestic, child care sector as the women of the developed countries are working outside homes. Nor surprisingly in development studies, the stress has been to bring policies that facilitate women migrating to work. Moreover, women's agencies have been very active to make women's contribution visible in development through remittances and also it is supposed to empower women through economic independence, skill development, exposure etc.

The chapter will review the existing literature on migration within leading development agencies and will see if increased migration is just a need of the market or really an empowering experience? It is rather dangerous to draw and generalize from few empowering experiences. As discussed in the earlier chapter, women's empowerment can be a very elusive concept when the systems of women's subordination keep shifting to either accommodate each other or contradict each other to gain a dominant position. Without understanding this dynamicity, women merely just shift from one form of subordination to another without empowerment. Development discourses in such an instance has been more of market ally than pro marginalized people. As demonstrated in the first chapter development studies have also moved along and suited well alongside neo liberalism.

Migration is one such contested terrain which has come in the guise of empowerment, development, human rights, exploitation or security concerns for countries. The General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) is the first and only set of multilateral rules governing international trade in services stresses that services represent the fastest growing sector of the global economy and account for two thirds of global output, one

third of global employment and nearly 20% of global trade. It was negotiated in Uruguay Round and developed in response to the huge growth of the services economy over the past 30 years and the greater potential for trading services brought about by the communications revolution.

When the idea of bringing rules on services into the multilateral trading system was floated in the early to mid 1980s, a number of countries were skeptical and even opposed. They believed such an agreement could undermine governments' ability to pursue national policy objectives and constrain their regulatory powers (http://192.91.247.23/english/tratop_e/serv_e/serv_e.htm). No doubt migration has been empowering for skilled professionals who have been able to gain much more through immigration into developed countries. However trafficking in human being is another side of the story which results from existing vulnerability in women and a glaring proof of how concentrating on only one facet of empowerment can turn into disempowering and exploitative situations.

In the past decade migration has also gained popularity through its links with development in the developing and least developed countries. The development agencies have been increasingly advocating for migration policies that will facilitate temporary migration of workers. There has been an increased recognition of the significance of migration in mainstream development studies. Though the conclusions about the role of migration in development differ hugely, the mainstream development has accommodated migration as one of the important component which can contribute to development and also empower women to free themselves from the clutches of patriarchy. But in reality it only empowers those who have some skills, capital and education. How much an individual benefit in migration also depends on his/her skills, knowledge etc. The evidence demonstrate that the most excluded and the marginalized are trafficked for cheap labour, commercial exploitation, bonded labour and various forms of forced labour. The labour intensive industries that have shifted to the third world country largely depend upon women's cheap labour for profit. It is highly unrealistic to expect development to reach to the most marginalized through migration, as they are supplied

into the most exploitative of the practices and the fall into the cycle of human rights violations. Moreover women who migrate for employment often get into labours that are viewed as women's domain reinforcing gender divide of the workforce.

Literature on migration is comparatively new though migration has always been a part of human history. Nomads moved from one place to another in search of better pasture. However the migration that came with development is of a different kind. The mass migration of people has lot to do with the kind of development that seeped in.

An overview of labour migration in Asia has been a region in motion since the 1970s, the time when migration became truly global (Massey et al 1998). The oil crisis of 1973 was a defining moment as far as migration trends go, reconfiguring the flows and directions of international migrations the world over. Where as before Asia was largely a region of out migration, since the 1970s Asia has been the site of intra regional migration.

The new kind of migration in South Asia began in 1970s. The era of organized migration was to fulfill the labor need in oil rich gulf countries. When the locals in the gulf countries moved to better job prospects, menial jobs were to be filled with the migrants from South Asia. This was dominated by male migrant workers. The construction sector, plantations, fishing and rice mill industries and factories in these countries experienced labour shortage. Slowly there was a demand for female migrants. The demand for female migrants was limited to domestic work and entertainers. On the other hand, the Middle East continued to draw migrants although not in the same scale as in the previous decade. A remarkable development was the opening of the labour market to women migrants to fill jobs in services, sales and professionals. The Phillipino, Indonesia and Sri Lanka became the major source countries. The female migrant responded to the labour shortage in the informal/reproductive sector. The caregiving crisis in households reflects how families and households are acted upon and act upon the changes wrought upon by globalization. In developed countries, households turn to women migrants to meet the shortage of domestic services as women join the labour market.

The growing participation of women migrant in the 1980s expanded the discussion of migration to include protection and rights related issues. These issues already surfaced in the Middle East bound migration, but they assumed greater urgency with regards to female migration because of their concentration in domestic work and entertainment.

In the 1990s, two new labour markets emerged: Taiwan and South Korea. Their transition from labour sending to labour importing countries occurred in a short span of time. South Korea for example was exporting workers to the Middle East in 1970s but became a labour importing county in 1990s. (DAW, 2002) There has been an increase in intra state migration and especially with the Asian countries turning into Export Processing Zone, large number of women and children have flocked into the cities in search of jobs.

Women and migration

In the second chapter it was discussed that EPZ depend much on women's labour. There has been a steady increase in women migrating outside for jobs. At no time in human history have as many women been on the move as today. About 90 million women reside outside their countries of origin. The intra state migration must be much higher, however we don't have data for that. Women migrant today represent half of the world's migrants (Zlontik, 2003) What is different today is the sheer scale of migration and the entry of women into migration streams that had been primarily male. A gender perspective on migration extends current understanding about international migration by examining the gender specific causes of migration, the vulnerability as well as the potential for the empowerment of migrant women and the consequences of migration. In the countries where the effects of globalization have increased poverty and left women with limited economies, social and political rights, migration may be the only way to improve their social and economic situations if there are no other means of assistance or development. Earlier women migrated accompanying their husbands or fathers, however, today when more women are migrating on their own as principal wage earners they tend to work in traditional female occupations including domestic work, the garment industry, nursing and teaching. The average earning of migrant women tend to be lower than men.

As of 2000, 49 percent of all international migrants were women or girls. In addition, relation of power, the capacity to control of influence others are key elements in the social construction of gender. Asymmetrical relations of power between men and women exist because of prevailing gender norms and practices. However, the asymmetries are also embedded in societal institutions, ranging from the family and the educational system to the economic and political systems and the legal system. They are associated with unequal access to resources, diminished social and economic status, vulnerability to abuse and violence and reduced life chances. Women are usually disadvantaged relative to men. Individual's decision to migrate is influenced not only by her or his agency but also by membership in social groups, by the existence of groups and networks organized to move people and by overall economic or political conditions.

For both women and men, economic and political conditions provide the general context within which migration decisions are made. However, gender relations at various levels and social stratification have an important role to play in decisions to migrate. When policies and practices that discriminate against women are in place, for example to access to resources, educational opportunities and political participation, women's capacities to participate and contribute fully in society are diminished.

Specific conditions govern the extent of labour migration of women. Firstly, gender specific labour demand in receiving countries predicted on gender norms and hierarchies in those countries stimulates the migration of women. Labour demand for domestic workers, nurses and entertainment is targeted towards recruiting women. Secondly, gender specific labour supply is produced by gender norms and stereotyping that is greatly facilitated by economic globalization, which linked the economies of origin and destination countries together led to trade agreement that contain provisions for mobility of international personnel goods and services. At the same time demographic trends with many developed countries faced population stagnation and ageing while developing countries continue to grow faster than their job markets can absorb new

workers. The new era of migration is also facilitated by the revolution in technology and communication.

Women, Migration, Development and Gendered Concerns

Inclusion and visibility of women in development has been very crucial in women's movement and development studies. With the first World Conference on Women in Mexico City, held in 1975, the United Nations launched a series of world conferences that highlighted the important role women play in development processes as well as the barriers that exist to involving them fully in such processes. Other major conferences such as the International Conference on Population and Development held in Cairo in 1994, reinforced the need to involve women in decision making on every aspect of economic, social and political development and the mainstream gender perspective in all programmes and policies.

The programme for action of the ICPD included a number of specific references to issues of particular concern to migrant women and refugees. It stated that national admission policies should not be discriminated in nature and that governments should give special attention to protecting women and children migrants. The programme of Action urged governments to recognize the importance of family unity in framing immigration policies and encouraged efforts to foster the positive effects of international migration including remittances and technology transfer. The conference highlighted the need to combat trafficking in migrants with special emphasis on the need to combat trafficking in migrants and on the need to protect women and children trafficked for sexual exploitation and coercive adoption.

The Platform of Action of the fourth World Conference on Women held in Beijing in 1995, recognized that movements of people have profound consequences on families and have unequal consequences for women and men. The Platform for Action highlighted the vulnerability of migrant and refuge women and children to violence human rights abuse and sexual exploitation and included recommendations on the legal and economic

improvement of migrant women, including trafficked women refugees and displaced persons.

The UN and other development agencies working on gender and migration have been concerned about a) bring national, bilateral and international policies that facilitate women to migrate within and beyond borders b) To make women's contribution visible in development through their earnings, remittance. The general assumption has been that women moving out of their homes and towns is empowering in itself and also they contribute to their families and their societies through their earning.

The General Assembly in the outcome document of its twenty third special session (Resolution 3/23-3, annex) reiterated that some women and girls continue to encounter barriers to justice and the enjoyment of their human rights because of such factors as their race, language, ethnicity, culture, religion, disability or socio economic class or because they are indigenous people, migrants including women migrant workers, displaced women or refugees.

In its resolution 58/208, the General Assembly called upon all relevant bodies, agencies, funds and programmes of the UN system and other relevant intergovernmental regional and subregional organizations within their continuing mandated activities to continue to address the issue of international migration and development with a view to integrating migration issues including gender perspective and cultural diversity in a more coherent way within the broader context of the implementation of agreed economic and social development goals and respect for all human rights.

However, as mentioned earlier, the issues of human rights violation started surfacing as women were migrating for jobs in the gulf. Within South Asia one of the major concern has been women trafficked for commercial sexual exploitation. With the advent of globalization and technology revolution, the movement of people has increased leaps and bounds. Moreover, migration of people for work in different cities have created unattached males and females. Acceptability of men buying sex is quite high in South

Asian scenario. On one hand, sexual and physical violence against migrant women and movement of women for the purpose of commercial sex has raised the alarm of governments, international organizations and the civil society organizations. The General Assembly considers the issue of trafficking in women and children on a biennial basis. The GA has increasingly focused on issues related to women and migration such as violence against women migrant workers, trafficking in women and children and the impact of armed conflict or women and children who may find themselves in temporary or permanent refugee or displaced situations. The UN and other development agencies have been engaged in developing ways to check different forms of violence against women.

The Secretary General report on violence against women migrant workers (A/58/161) highlighted various measures undertaken by a number of countries to address violence against women workers. Those measures include legislative changes to protect women from all forms of violence promoting women's access to social security services and ensuring that women migrant workers do not suffer discrimination in employment related matters. The report also refers to preventive strategies such as education and economic empowerment targeted at potential women migrant workers.

The report of the Secretary General on international migration and development (A/58/98) summarizes activities relating to those areas that have been carried out by the UN system, including by the UN Secretariat, other bodies of UN system and the key entities outside the UN such as International Organization for Migration. To support the ongoing discussion on international development and migration, the World Economic and Social Survey 200 A focuses on international migration and development including the gender dimension of international migration.

Discourses on migration in the domain of development

Beyond the concerns of human rights violation, development agencies also have been working to make the flow of migrant's earning visible in development. Since women

compromise almost half of migrant, the remittance from women migrants is very significant. Though it is not proved, however women are expected to send more of their earnings than men due to their gender roles. In its resolutions 54/210 of 22 December 1999 and 58/206 of 23 December 2003, the General Assembly requested the Secretary General to update the 'World Survey on the Role of Women in Development' for consideration by the General Assembly during its fifty ninth session. The present world survey addresses key issues related to women and international migration.

While all these documents realize the dangers faced by women due to their vulnerability, however the tone of empowerment is equally strong. They believe that "Gender inequality can be a powerful factor in precipitation of migration when women have economic, political and social expectations that opportunities at home do not meet. Migration can be empowering experience for women. In the process of international migration women may move away from situations where they live under traditional, patriarchal authority to situations where they are empowered to greater autonomy over their own lives." The assumption is that migrant women play an important role in development in both their country of destination and their country of origin through financial contributions from remittances, the improvement of the education and skills of the next generation. Some leading agencies are even advocating that if flow of labour migrants is increased by few percentage, the revenue earned can actually take the place of development assistance.

Female migrants are increasingly part of worker flows, moving on their own to become principal wage earners for their families. Most women move voluntarily but women and girls are also part of the flows of forced migrants who have fled conflict, persecution, environmental degradation, natural disasters and other situations that affect their habitat, livelihood and security.

However, the development agencies calculate remittance in comparison to Official Development Aid. "Individual remittance transfer continue to be an important source of income for many families in developing countries. In 1990, international migrants sent

about 30 billion USD to developing countries. As of 2003, according to conservative estimates by the IMF international remittance to developing countries exceeded USD60 billion per year (IMF 2004). Since ODA seldom exceeds USD 60 billion international migrants are contributing more financial resources to their home countries than are contributed by developed countries.” (Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2002)

“Global flows of aid amount to USD 68.5 billion per year. The United Nations estimates that the Millennium Development Goals could be met if aid were increased to USD 100 billion per year. A slight relaxation of restrictions on the movement of workers-increasing the proportion of migrants in the workforce of developed countries to 3 percent- would deliver global gains of perhaps USD 150 billion per year. Remittances sent home by international migrants through official channels currently amount to USD 93 billion per year; with informal transfers included, remittances are likely to amount to around USD 300 billion per year. Migration delivers massive economic gains, which could be used for poverty reduction.” (House of Commons International Development Committee, Sixth Report of Session 2003-2004)

The summary report of the United Nations General Assembly, Sixtieth session Agenda item 54 “Globalization and Interdependence: international migration and Development says that, “..international migration constitutes an ideal means of promoting co-development, that is, the coordinated or concerted improvement of economic conditions in both areas of origin and areas of destination based on the complementarities between them. The report discusses the various ways in which international migration can contribute to co-development.” The report was prepared for the High Level dialogue on International Migration and Development coming up in September 2006

The funds sent back to developing countries at least USD 167 billion in 2005 alone dwarfs all the aid combined. We now understand better than ever before that migration is not a zero sum game. In the best cases, it benefits the receiving country, the country of origin and the migrants themselves.

It is obvious that the migrants sending money to the development countries has been on steady rise. It rose many times since 90s. International Organization for Migration also believes that migrants are development resource. "International liberalization has gone far with respect to movement of capital, goods and services. Current international institutions provide little space or initiatives for negotiations on labor mobility and the flow of remittances. There is a pressing need to reinforce the view of migrants as development resource. Remittances are double the size of aid and at least as well targeted at the poor. Migrant diasporas are engaged in transnational practices with direct effects on aid and development." (IOM, 2003)

Oxfam believes that migration is a feature of the globalising world and that it can, if properly managed and facilitated, do three things. First it can have positive effects on the labour markets, economies and societies of the host countries in the West. Further, it can provide important sources of finance and human capital in order to stimulate development in the sending countries. And finally, it can be an immensely positive experience for the migrants themselves, above all because of its potential to improve their incomes and livelihoods, and those of their families. (Oxfam, 2003)

The role of development agencies has been clearly equating the transfer of goods and capital to the third world countries with the movement of labour. The role of states is not as clear though. The developing countries are worried about human rights violation in destination countries but at the same time they also depend on revenue generated from labour migration. In Nepal, tourism declined steadily since 2000 with the heightening Maoist movement. Tourism was the highest among the foreign exchange generating industries which had to be compensated with labour remittances. But concerned with rape and human rights violation of women in destination countries, women were banned from going to Arab states for labours. Till 2003 Nepal didn't issue visa or passport without the consent of father or husband in the name of protecting dignity of women. However, when the government realized that it was not exactly stopping women, moreover, women were being trafficked and were at risk of being violated even more when they used illegal channels

and fall prey to traffickers, the ban was lifted (Haque, 2005) However, some countries are still banned where human rights violations are high. The ban was finally lifted in 2003 after the continued pressure from women's organizations and UN specialized agencies like UNIFEM. Pakistan also does not encourage women migration. Only .04% of total migrant workers are women from Pakistan. Pakistan does not permit the migration of women under 45 as domestic aides (Labour Migration in Asia: Trends, challenges and policy responses in countries of origin; International Organization for Migration; Geneva, 2003, Page: 21).

While the developing countries are caught between human rights violation, trafficking and revenue, the developed countries' dilemma is between traditional security concerns and liberal ethos.

Some of the literature is highly critical of remittances as resource for development observing that money sent back by foreign workers is spent largely on consumer items. Only a small portion is invested directly in productive activities. Excessive consumerism can lead to inequities with remittances dependent households exceeding the standard of living available to those without family members working abroad often attempts to encourage or require the investment of remittances lead to few economic improvements.

In the light of increasing trafficking in women and children various international instruments specifically or generally enumerate the rights of migrants are: International Human Rights Conventions including the International Covenants on civil and political rights and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights provide important protection for migrant women and girls. During the past decade, a number of international regional and national instruments dealing specifically with migration have been adopted which include provisions applicable to migrant women. They include the International Covenant on the Protection of the rights of all migrant workers and members of their families. The Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in persons specifically women and children supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crimes and the Protocol against the smuggling of

migrants by land, sea and air supplementing the United Nations Conventions against transnational organized crime.

Increasing awareness on gender and migration where experience is not the same as for men

Many women who migrated find themselves at risk of gender based violence and exploitation whether they are labour migrants, family migrants, trafficked persons or refugees, they face the triple burden of being female, foreign and then working in dangerous occupations. In addition, it is important to keep in mind that gender intersects with race, ethnicity and religion and can result in differential access to opportunities.

The 'World Survey on the role of women in development, women and international migration addresses both the opportunities for empowerment of migrant women and the challenges and vulnerabilities women face in the context of migration.

Gender relations and gender hierarchies in both origin and destination countries determine the gender specific impacts. The effects of pre-existing gender inequalities are often increased for women who move as refugees or displaced persons and for those who are trafficked are perhaps the most vulnerable of all migrant women, as the process of trafficking by definition is one that involves exploitation, coercion and the abuse of power. Trafficking builds on existing gender inequalities. Trafficked women usually originate from regions where opportunities for women are low and where they are dependent on others and lack independent access to resources to alter their situations.

Nonetheless migrant women's employment and earnings, and their exposure to the gender relations in host societies, often instigate changes in gender relations between family members and enhance migrant women's autonomy and empowerment outcomes are not straight forward, however, gains may be made at the household level.

However, the document stresses that if movement is regularized rather than made strict, it could deter trafficking and at the same time migrants can be a resource of poverty reduction and sustainable development in their home countries. If development is chanelised properly it can be the means by which people can stay at home and enjoy greater economic opportunity and is an important aspect of the migration-development nexus. Migration should be voluntary on the part of the migrant and the destination country not faced by economic or political conditions in country of origin.

But when we look at the dimension of trafficking it is hard to say what voluntary means and it is also hard to say that whether it is developing countries that benefit through remittances or it is again the developed countries who benefit from the labour of trafficked victims and local traffickers who make some money by supplying mainly women and children or local industrialists from cheap labour.

Trafficking in human being is clandestine and it is hard to get data. Intra state trafficking data is even harder to collect. Among the most quoted figures are the United Nations estimate that '4 million people in a year are traded against their will to work in some form of slavery, many of them are children and in last 30 years, trafficking in women and children for sexual exploitation has alone victimized more than 30 million people."

The ILO has calculated the profit generated through trafficked victims by the modest number of 2.5 million people who are exploited by private agents and enterprises are in forced labour as a result of human trafficking. Given the fact that trafficking in human being by its nature itself is hard to get data which is further shrouded by definition of trafficking that excludes many forms of trafficking. South Asia Convention on suppression and prevention of trafficking takes trafficking exclusively as trafficking for commercial sexual exploitation. Of these 2.5 million, it has been calculated that about 1.1 million are in commercial sexual exploitation (CSE), 800,000 are in other economic exploitation (EE), and 600,000 are undetermined. If it is assumed that half of the undetermined victims are distributed in each of the two categories, we find that there are about 1.4 million in commercial sexual exploitation (CSE) and 1.1 million in other

economic exploitation (EE). Thus, contrary to forced labour in general, more than half of trafficking is for forced sexual exploitation. However, trafficking is not exclusively a “sex issue”. With more than 40 percent of cases, “the labour dimension of trafficking” also represents a large share of all cases.

Profits from all forced labour: ILO estimated that the global profits made by private agents and enterprises with the world’s 9.8 million forced labourers amount to **US\$ 44.3 billion** per year. This represents roughly US\$ 4,500 per victim per year. The largest profits are made in industrial countries (US\$ 18.8 billion), followed by Asia (US\$ 13.7 billion), Latin America (US\$ 5.7 billion) and transition countries (US\$ 3.6 billion). The two regions where profits are lowest are the Middle East and North Africa (US\$ 1.6 billion) and Sub-Saharan Africa (US\$ 0.7 billion). However, **profits from all trafficked forced labourers is much higher**. ILO estimated that the global profits made with the world’s 2.5 million forced labourers who have been trafficked amount to US\$ 31.6 billion per year. This represents an annual average of US\$ 13’000 per victim. Thus, profits are higher with trafficked victims than with non-trafficked victims. Profits are by far the highest in industrial countries (US\$ 15.5 billion), followed by Asia (US\$ 9.7 billion), transition countries (US\$ 3.4 billion) and Middle East and North Africa (US 1.5 billion). The two regions where profits are lowest are Latin America (US\$ 1.3 billion) and Sub-Saharan Africa (US\$ 0.1 billion). (Belsler, Patrick, Michaelle de Cock, and Farhad Mehran. 2005. *An ILO Minimum Estimate of Forced Labour in the World*, International Labour Office, Geneva.) The estimation is based on the total profits which can be broadly defined as the total economic value-added minus total wage payments. In the case of forced labour, wages are usually below market rates and many victims are paid just enough for their subsistence. In the most extreme cases, traffickers and other perpetrators have complete discretion over the payments to forced labourers. Hence, it is difficult to consider whatever payment the victims receive as a “wage” in its standard definition, i.e. the compensation obtained by voluntary workers in the labour market. This, however, does not change the fact that the expenditures for the subsistence of workers reduce the profits of the perpetrators and, hence, must be deducted from value-added.

Trafficking is defined as ‘the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons by means of threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of a giving or receiving of payment or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation.

Trafficking usually takes place in the guise of migration. Though there might be few cases of kidnapping and forced transport, however most of the trafficking cases are the ones who are transported willingly in the promise of lucrative jobs. Trafficking uses the processes of migration. The scale of migration process indicates the pervasiveness and normalcy of the phenomenon and, “it spans all countries and virtually affects every town, village and rural area of the world.” The 1991 Census of India revealed that 222.6 million people were internal lifetime migrants of which 168 million were females. The ratio of female migrants to the total female population was 40.3 per cent, whereas the ration of male migrants to the total male population was only 13.9 per cent. Evidence based on NSS figures for 1992-1993 and 1999-2000 suggests that the proportion of migrants of both sexes, in both rural and urban areas, increased during the last decade of the 20th century (Srivastava and Sasikumar in ISS-NHRC-UNIFEM study 2005)

An expert group meeting organized by the Division for the advancement of women in 2002 concluded that trafficking has supply and demand dimensions. On the supply side factors that rendered persons especially women and children vulnerable to trafficking were development processes based on class, gender and cultural concerns that marginalize women, in particular from employment and education; displacement as a result of natural and human made catastrophes; dysfunctional families; and gendered cultural practices; gender discrimination and gender based violence in families and communities.

Without demand, however, there would be no market for the services of trafficked persons. The expert group concluded that the demand driven causes were globalization

that had fuelled the development of economic sectors with a woman specific demand for cheap labour and the growth of commercial sex industry, exploitation in labour market, especially exploitation of illegal and unregulated work of migrants.

The NHRC-ISS-UNIFEM study also tries to theorize the movement of people and trafficking in terms of push and pull factors. Push factors are associated with sending regions and pull factors with receiving regions. These factors are inter dependent and are classified as economic, political, socio-cultural or environmental in nature. The push factor include growing inequalities in wealth between and within countries, economic decline, a lack of economic opportunities and the under-development of an area, poverty, underemployment, landlessness, discrimination, population pressure, harsh economic policies, limited access to resources, lack of opportunities for local employment that allow women to explore better jobs or acquire greater skills to obtain a more secure future and a lack of basis sustenance. The pull factor include the real or perceived differences in wage, more and better employment opportunities in destination areas, the demand for female migrant workers in more developed regions, and economic boom in destination areas, a growing number of women and men in destinations who relegate domestic work to hired help etc. A dynamic relationship between two regions, involving the interplay of various factors, results in migratory streams, patterns and flows. Some of these are likely to provide contexts in which people are vulnerable to trafficking. The study on trafficking in women and children in India found that 79.55 per cent of the trafficked victims were from landless households and families depending on wage labour for survival.

Trafficked victims may believe that they will work in legitimate occupation but may find themselves trapped into forced prostitution, marriage, domestic work, sweatshop and other forms of exploitation that constitute a contemporary form of slavery. In addition traffickers control victims through debt bondage, taking advantage of the inability to migrants to pay in advance the high fees for the travel arrangements, as fixed by the traffickers. Debt bondage can amount to virtual slavery, particularly for women and children forced into sexually exploitative occupations. The trafficking of people for

prostitution and forced labour is one of the fastest growing areas of international criminal activity. Traffickers entice victims to migrate voluntarily with false promises of good well paid jobs in foreign countries. Various studies report that a modest account of women being trafficking into India from Nepal would be 7000-9000 per year.

Trafficking is now considered the third largest source of profit for organized crime after drugs and arms generating billions of dollars. (Heyzer 2002) The larger number of migrant women workers from South Asia find themselves trapped in a labour market that operates clandestinely and outside the law. Human trafficking is a well-established conduit of labour supply in the region, with an entrenched and effective system of providing women and child workers not only to the sex trade but also to other over ground sectors of the economy, which exploit their extreme vulnerability to ensure that wages are kept to the barest minimum. Globally, human trafficking has increased in scope and with an annual turnover of USD 7 to 13 billion. This is the figure coming out of only the movement of people and the gains out of that transaction. The value addition to the labour of trafficked persons is much higher as demonstrated earlier from ILO study.

Now coming to development through migration, one question that arises out of it is - whose development?

Amidst growing literature on development through migration, it is a well established fact that the only the ones who are already empowered benefit from migration like the professionals, business persons etc. Developed countries benefit from the immigration of trained professionals into their countries. It is often said that it is the aid from the developing world to the developed through the migration of trained people. Market pull for labour within borders or across countries is for semi skilled and unskilled workers who are highly exploited. Moreover, the ones who get through legal channels are most of the time who are little educated or have some sort of capital that can be used to get them jobs. The most vulnerable are trafficked.

No wonder trafficking in persons is increasing in response to the growing market because the profit generated from trafficked victims is much higher than the regular migrants for labour. It is not to say that regular labour migrants do not face violation and exploitation. Now coming to gender, it is quite natural that trafficking in women and children is much higher as compared to men which makes their poverty and powerlessness much severe due to existing gender relations. The market is also segmented on the basis of age and sex.

In such a situation, development agencies harping on empowerment based on safe migration, stringent laws and regulation, human rights conventions, gender perspective on migration seem meaningless when the very ground that they are trying to negotiate is that of utter powerlessness and deprivations. Moreover, depending upon their wage and remittance for their own development is quite unrealistic when the market forces seem to make much more out of their exploited labour than the migrant labourers or trafficked labourers.

Now coming to non zero sum understanding of empowerment in the context of migration, it raises questions like whose empowerment? As elaborated in the earlier chapter about women's subordination, my dissertation depends upon capitalism and patriarchy as two system of exploitation. The interaction between the two systems and power within the systems bring specific outcomes for women separated by space, time, culture etc. The state being patriarchal and capitalist institution also expropriate women's reproductive and other labour for its benefit. Though sometime it becomes a dilemma for states like in the case of Nepal where it turned patriarch by restricting women's mobility out of the country in the name of protecting women's dignity but at the same time it is also favoring in policies as the demand for female labour is growing in regional EPZ, and women's specific work like domestic work and childcare.

Development agencies is another entity which talks the language of the poor but haven't been able to challenge the major systems of exploitation and work towards development that is sustainable and really reaches the most marginalized. This perhaps can be

explained by the power of the powerful within the system that can produce knowledge and strategies that suit them.

Empowerment through migration is highly questionable in the light of growing trade in women. And also in the development discourses that equates goods and capital with labour should question whether the women who sell their labour or bodies in competitive market- do they trade in equal terms? And how fair is it to further rest the argument in 'migration for development' when the market forces further exploit the most marginalized for profit and the state depend on their remittances for development. The market and state both further reinforce capitalism and patriarchy.

Conclusions

My dissertation reviewed the concept of empowerment in the domain of development especially if migration can be an empowering experience for women. Leading development agencies including United Nations have been working to bring policy changes in the sending and receiving countries to have easier migration laws, temporary migration to fill up jobs on short term basis, safeguard human rights in destination countries and to stop trafficking by safer migration of women. Migration is also presumed to be a developmental aid for the sending countries through remittances. My dissertation traced the development studies itself from the 50s, women's role in development and the development of international economy. It found that it is hard to have a linear relationship between migration and empowerment for women, and especially for those women who are forced to migrate, because of the complex web of power relations within and between systems. Trafficking in women and children is an obvious consequence of this power relations where desire to migrate turn into further exploitations.

Furthermore, it seems that discourses on development are merely a tool for economic development of those who are already powerful. It raises some serious questions like if knowledge and truth is propagated by the powerful for their own benefits, then can the field of development be free from power relations?

When we talk of empowerment of women, it is also important to understand the source of disempowerment. Women's subordination is not only due to their relation with men but also their relation with economic system. The neo liberal economy coupled with globalization brings in various realities for women depending upon their stages of empowerment. Empowerment depends upon control of sources of power.

In Sociology, generally power is considered non zero sum. Power is always associated with one's ability to make others act for his or her benefit which usually derives from control over sources of power like human, economic or ideological resources.

Empowerment, which necessarily involves changes in power relations, should also bring changes in the sources of power. On the issues of women's empowerment, a change in one aspect is assumed to bring changes in other aspects and trigger a cycle of empowerment. Power is assumed to be non zero sum and therefore, skill development of women, economic empowerment and mere awareness of oppression is presumed to have empowering impact on women.

However, a large number of women are not just fighting oppression against poverty and patriarchy at individual level but fighting patriarchy and poverty that is much more systemic and structural. What has been ignored is power of systems itself where patriarchy and capitalism change contents according to the context to meet their needs of hierarchy and oppression. The relation between patriarchy and capitalism is that of mutual accommodation and also that of conflict. The desire of empowerment that revolves around meeting strategic gender needs by fulfilling practical gender needs becomes a conceptual fallacy in the context where patriarchy and capitalism is that of mutual accommodation. This kind of empowerment might work where women's subordination is only based on male domination. However, in the context of Third World, the oppression is also geo-political.

In empowerment approach, power is being used in a romantic way without threatening or challenging the global forces which is actually disempowering women. We cannot celebrate women's empowerment and their approaches like microcredit etc without regard to the structural constraints within which they protest, act and resist. In the attempt to localize the struggle, the class, gender, ethnicity issues within local spaces get hidden. Market-based solution is only leading to extraction of women's labor and resources for the purpose of market (Staudt et al, 2001). Moreover, the neo classical model ignores that every economy is characterized by two systems-the system of production of material goods and the system of reproduction of labor force. The existence of a gender based division and segmentation of labor in particular and patriarchy in general ensures that women's choices and rationality differ significantly from man's. (Dewan, 1999).

I feel that developmental approaches have mainly responded to the needs of the economy. Development discourses have ignored the interaction, conflict and mutual accommodation between patriarchy and capitalism. This could be one of the reasons why women move from one kind of disempowerment into another without any liberating experience.

When we examine the context within which migration occurs, it is the kind of economic development that we have today demanding labour and more so for feminized labour. In development studies, human rights aspect of movement of people does not look into the forced nature of migration. This explain why when migration is promoted as a means to women's empowerment without addressing their subordination at home and the context within which migration occurs, it is often turning into trafficking and further exploitation.

However, I do not want to make a fatalistic statement where it seems impossible to get out of this web of power relations. It needs to be further explored on how one can turn this situation into one's benefit. I have featured Women's Development Porgramme in Rajasthan to demonstrate where women challenged the power relations in very patriarchal, feudal, caste based society. It shows that once women get into the cycle of empowerment, there is no going back. It has been unfortunate that the jargon of women's empowerment has been misused in development to shift the kinds of subordination but I still believe in women's empowerment and one needs to work out carefully on how to bring this change.

Reference:

Barry, Allen (1999) "Power/Knowledge Critical Essays of Michel Foucault" (Ed.) Karlis Racevskis. New York: G.K. Hall &Co

Banerjee, N. (1999) "Analyzing Women's Work Under Patriarchy" in Kumkum Sangari and Uma Chakravarti (eds.) *Myths to Markets : Essays on Gender*, New Delhi: Manohar Publishers.

Banerjee, N. (2002) 'Strengthening the Role of Labour Standards in Selected Developing Member Countries- Regional Review: Equality in Economic Activities and Employment', ILO

Bartky, S (1988) "Foucault, Femininity, and the Modernization of Patriarchal power," in , Irene Diamond and Lee Quinby (ed.) *Feminism and Foucault: Reflections on Resistance* Boston: Northeastern University Press

Batliwala S. (1983) *Empowerment of Women in South Asia: Concepts and Practices*, New Delhi: Asian-South Pacific Bureau of Adult Education and Freedom from Hunger Campaign

Batliwala, S. (1997) "What is female empowerment?", Stockholm, the 25th of April 1997

Bennholdt-Thomsen, V. (1988) 'Investment in Poor: Analysis of World Bank policy'. *In Women: The last colony* by M. Mies, London: Zed

Boserup, E. (1970) *Woman's Role in Economic Development*, London: Allen and Unwin

Brandt Commission (1980) *North-South: A Programme for Survival*, London: Pan

Brandt Commission (1983) *Common Crisis: North-South Cooperation for World Recovery*, London: Pan

Buvinic, M., Lycette, M. and McGreevey, W. (1983) "Women and Poverty in the Third World", Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press; especially 'Women's issues in Third World poverty: a policy analysis', pp. 14-33

Chambers, R. (1997) *Whose Reality Counts? Putting the First Last*, London: Intermediate Technology Publications.

Deveaux Monique (Summer ,1994) "Feminism and Empowerment: A Critical Reading of Foucault", *Feminist Studies*, Vol. 20, No. 2, Women's Agency: Empowerment and the Limits of Resistance, 223-247

Dewan Ritu (1999) "Gender in Neo-Classical Economics: A Conceptual Overview" in Kumkum Sangari and Uma Chakravarti (eds.) *Myths to Markets: Essays on Gender*, New Delhi: Manohar Publishers.

Division for the Advancement of Women (2002) "Trafficking in women and girls", Expert Group Meeting, Harrison Conference Center, Glen Cove, New York, 18 - 22 November 2002

Edna Acosta-Belen, Bose C.E. (1990) 'From Structural Subordination to Empowerment: Women and Development in Third World Contexts' *Gender and Society*, Vol. 4, No. 3, Special Issue: Women and Development in the Third World (Sep), 299-320

Eisenstein Zillah (1979) "Developing a Theory of Capitalist Patriarchy and Socialist Feminism" in Zillah Eisenstein (ed.) *Capitalist Patriarchy and the Case for Socialist Feminism*, NY: Moubly Review Press

Escobar, A. (1995) *Encountering Development: The Making and Unmaking of the Third World*, Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press

Foucault, Michel (1980) in Colin Gordon (Ed.) *Power Knowledge: Selected Interviews & other Writings 1972-1977*, New York: Pantheon Books,

Frank, A.G. (1996) 'The Development of Underdevelopment', *Monthly Review* 18 (4): 17-31

Freire, P. (1970) *The Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, New York: The Seabury Press

Haque, S. (2005) "The Dynamics of Migration in South Asia: An Overview", paper presented at the Regional Conference on Revisiting the Migration and Trafficking Nexus: The South Asian Scenario', April 4-6, 2005, Dhaka, Bangladesh

Hartmann Heidi (Spring, 1976) "Capitalism, Patriarchy, and Job Segregation by Sex", *Signs*, Vol. 1, No. 3, Women and the Workplace: The Implications of Occupational Segregation, 137-169

Hartsock, N (1990) "Foucault on Power: A Theory for Women?" in Linda Nicholson (ed.) *Feminism/Postmodernism*, New York and London: Routledge

House of Commons International Development Committee (Sixth Report of Session 2003-2004) "Migration and Development: how to make migration work for poverty reduction"

International Organization for Migration (2003) "The Migration-Development Nexus: Evidence and Policy Options", IOM Migration Research Series, No 8., January 2003

IOM (2003) "Labour Migration in Asia: Trends, challenges and policy responses in countries of origin" International Organization for Migration; Geneva

Jacobsen, J.P. (1994) *The Economics of Gender*, Oxford: Blackwell Publishers Ltd

Jana Sawicki (Fall 1986) "Identity Politics and Sexual Freedom," in *Feminism and Foucault*

John Mary E. (2002) 'Feminism, poverty and globalization: an Indian view', *Inter Asia Cultrual Studies*, Volume 3, Number 3, pp 251-364.

Kathleen Staudt; Shirin M. Rai; Jane L. Parpart (Summer, 2001), "Protesting World Trade Rules: Can We Talk about Empowerment?", *Signs*, Vol. 26, No. 4, Globalization and Gender, 1251-1257

Kay, C. (1989) *Latin American Theories of Development and Underdevelopment*, London and New York: Routledge

Mallon, F. E. (1987) 'Patriarchy in the Transition to Capitalism: Central Peru, 1830-1950', *Feminist Studies*, Vol. 13, No. 2, pp 379-407

Marcoux, A. (1998) "The Feminization of Poverty Claims, Facts and Data Needs," *Population and Development Review* 24 (1), 131-139, New York: The Population Council

McAfee, Kathy & Myrna Wood (1969) "Bread & roses" in *Leviathan*, vol. 1 , no. 3, June 1969

Moser, C. (1989) 'Gender Planning in the Third World: meeting practical and strategic gender needs', *World Development*, 17:11

Nash, J. and Kelly, F. (1983) (eds.) *Women, men, and the international division of labor*, Albany: Suny Press

Nelson, N. and Wright, S. (1995) 'Participation and power', in N. Nelson and S. Wright (eds) *Power and Participatory Development: Theory and Practice*, London: Intermediate Technology Publications, pp 1-18

NHRC; ISS; UNIFEM (2005) *Trafficking in Women and Children in India*, New Delhi: Orient Longman

Oxfam (2003), International Development Committee: Inquiry on Migration and Development

Rowlands Jo, "Empowerment Examined" in *Development in Practice*, Vol 5, number 2.

Sadler J. 2004. "UNIFEM's Experiences in Mainstreaming for Gender Equality", http://www.unifem.org/index.php?f_page_pid=188

Schuurman, F. (1993) *Beyond the Impasse: New Directions in Development Theory*, London: Zed Books

Seager, J and Olson, Ann. (1986) *Women in the world: An international atlas*, New York: Simon & Schuster

Sen Amartya (2001) 'Many Faces of Gender Inequality' *Frontline*, volume 18, Issue 22, Oct 27-Nov

Sen, G. and Grown, C. (1987) *Development, crises, and alternative visions*, New York: Simon and Schuster.

Shafqat, M. (2003) 'Trafficking, South Asia and Pakistan', *Himal South Asian*, September 2003

Simon, D. and Narman, A. (1999) *Development Theory and Practice*, Harlow: Longman

Sunita Kishor, Gupta K (2004) "Women's Empowerment in India and its States: Evidence from the NFHS", *Economic and Political Weekly*, , Feb 14

Susan Bordo (1989) "The Body and the Reproduction of Femininity," in Alison Jaggar and Susan Bordo (ed.) *Gender, Body, Knowledge*, London and New Burnswick: J.J. Rutgers University Press

Walby Sylvia (1990) *Theorizing Patriarchy*, Oxford: Blackwell Publishers

Walby Sylvia. (1997) *Gender Transformations*, London: Routledge

Wallace, Michelle (1999, reprinted) *Black Macho and the Myth of Superwoman*, London and New York: Verso

Wallerstein, I. (1974) *The Capitalist World Economy: Essays*, New York: Academic Press

Weber M. (1962), *Basic Concepts in Sociology*, New York: Citadel Press.

World Economic Forum (2000) *Women's Empowerment: Measuring the Global Gender Gap*

